

1 TITLE

2 The cost of diagnostic uncertainty: A prospective economic analysis of febrile children attending an
3 NHS Emergency Department

4
5 AUTHORS

6 Simon Leigh MSc, Alison Grant RCN, Nicola Murray MBChB, Brian Faragher PhD, Henal Desai
7 MBChB, Samantha Dolan MBChB, Naeema MO Cabdi MBChB, James B Murray MBChB, Yasmin
8 Rejaei MBChB, Stephanie Stewart MBChB, Karl Edwardson, Jason Dean MMS, Bimal Mehta
9 MBChB, Shunmay Yeung MBChB, PhD, Frans Coenen PhD, Louis Niessen MD, PhD[#], and Enitan D
10 Carrol MBChB, MD, FRCPCH[#]

11 [#]Contributed equally

12
13 AFFILIATIONS

14
15 Alison Grant, Alder Hey Children's NHS Foundation Trust, Eaton Road, Liverpool, L12 2AP, UK

16 Alison.grant@alderhey.nhs.uk

17
18 Nicola Murray, The Royal Liverpool University Hospital, Prescot St, Liverpool, L7 8XP, UK

19 Nicolarosemurray@doctors.org.uk

20
21 Brian Faragher, Medical Statistics Unit, Department of Clinical Sciences, Liverpool School of

22 Tropical Medicine, Pembroke Place, Liverpool, L3 5QA, UK. Brian.faragher@lstmed.ac.uk

23
24 Henal Desai, Royal Derby Hospital, Uttoxeter Road, Derby, DE22 3NE, UK

25 HenalDesai@hotmail.com

26

27 Samantha Dolan, Royal Bolton Hospital, Minerva Road, Farnworth, BL4 0JR, UK

28 Samatha.dolan@boltonft.nhs.uk

29

30 Naeema MO Cabdi, School of Medicine, University of Liverpool, Cedar House, Liverpool, L69 3GE,

31 UK nmo.cabdi@gmail.com

32

33 James B Murray, Queen Elizabeth Hospital, Birmingham, Mindelsohn Way, B15 2TH, UK

34 James.murray2@uhb.nhs.uk

35

36 Yasmin Rejaei, Pinderfields District General Hospital, Aberford Road, Wakefield, WF1 4DG, UK

37 yasmin.rejaei@midyorks.nhs.uk

38

39 Stephanie Stewart, Wirral University Teaching Hospital, Arrowe Park Road, Wirral, CH49 5PE, UK

40 Stephanie.Stewart@nhs.net

41

42 Karl Edwardson, Information Department, Alder Hey Children's NHS Foundation Trust, Eaton Road,

43 Liverpool, L12 2AP, UK Karl.Edwardson@alderhey.nhs.uk

44

45 Jason Dean, Finance Department. Alder Hey NHS Foundation Trust, Eaton Road, Liverpool L12

46 2AP, UK Jason.Dean@alderhey.nhs.uk

47

48 Bimal Mehta, Emergency Department, Alder Hey Children's NHS Foundation Trust, Eaton Road,

49 Liverpool L12 2AP, UK bimal.mehta@nhs.net

50

51 Shunmay Yeung, Department of Clinical Research, MARCH Centre for Maternal, Adolescent,

52 Reproductive and Child Health, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, Keppel Street,

53 London WC1E 7HT, UK Shunmay.yeung@lshtm.ac.uk.

54 Frans Coenen, Department of Computer Science, The University of Liverpool, Ashton Building,
55 Ashton Street, Liverpool, L693BX, UK Coenen@liverpool.ac.uk

56

57 # Louis Niessen, Department of International Public Health and Clinical Sciences, Liverpool School
58 of Tropical Medicine and University of Liverpool, Liverpool, United Kingdom, UK, and Johns
59 Hopkins School of Public Health, USA, Louis.Niessen@lstmed.ac.uk.

60

61 # Enitan D Carrol, Institute of Infection and Global Health, University of Liverpool, 8 West Derby St,
62 Liverpool, L7 3EA, UK edcarrol@liv.ac.uk

63

64 # Contributed equally

65

66 CORRESPONDING AUTHOR

67

68 Simon Leigh, Institute of Infection and Global Health, University of Liverpool, 8 West Derby St,
69 Liverpool L69 7BE. Simon.leigh@liverpool.ac.uk. +44 7503 955 592

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79 ABSTRACT

80

81 Background

82 Paediatric fever is a common cause of emergency department (ED) attendance. A lack of prompt and
83 definitive diagnostics makes it difficult to distinguish viral from potentially life-threatening bacterial
84 causes, necessitating a cautious approach. This may result in extended periods of observation, additional
85 radiography, and the precautionary use of antibiotics (ABs) to deal with bacterial foci. This study
86 examines resource use, service costs, and health outcomes.

87

88 Methods

89 We studied an all-year prospective, comprehensive, and representative cohort of 6,518 febrile children
90 (aged <16 years), attending Alder Hey Children's Hospital, an NHS-affiliated paediatric care provider
91 in the North West of England, over a one-year period. Performing a time-driven and activity-based
92 micro-costing, we estimated the economic impact of managing paediatric febrile illness, with focus on
93 nurse/clinician time, investigations, radiography and inpatient stay. Using bootstrapped generalized
94 linear modelling (GLM, gamma, log), we identified the patient and healthcare provider characteristics
95 associated with increased resource use, applying retrospective case-note identification to determine
96 rates of potentially avoidable AB prescribing.

97

98 Results

99 Infants aged less than three months incurred significantly higher resource use than any other age-group,
100 at £1000.28 [95%CI £82.39-£2,993.37] per child, ($p<0.001$); while lesser experienced doctors exhibited
101 3.2-fold [95%CI 2.0-5.1-fold] higher resource use than consultants, ($p<0.001$). Approximately 32.4%
102 of febrile children received antibiotics and 7.1% were diagnosed with bacterial infections. Children
103 with viral illnesses for whom antibiotic prescription was potentially avoidable incurred 9.9-fold [95%CI
104 6.5-13.2-fold] cost increases compared to those not receiving antibiotics, equal to an additional
105 £1,352.10 per child; predominantly resulting from a 53.9 hour increase in observation and inpatient stay

106 (57.1 vs. 3.2 hours). Bootstrapped GLM suggested that infants aged below three months, those
107 prompting a respiratory rate “red flag”, treatment by lesser-experienced doctors and Manchester Triage
108 System (MTS) yellow or higher were statistically significant predictors of higher resource use in 100%
109 of bootstrap simulations.

110

111 Conclusion

112 The economic impact of diagnostic uncertainty when managing paediatric febrile illness is significant,
113 and the precautionary use of antibiotics is strongly associated with increased costs. The use of ED
114 resources is highest among infants (aged less-than-three months), and those infants managed by lesser
115 experienced doctors, independent of clinical severity. Diagnostic advances which could increase
116 confidence to withhold antibiotics, may yield considerable efficiency gains in these groups; where the
117 perceived risks of failing to identify potentially life-threatening bacterial infections are greatest.

118

119 Keywords

120 Febrile, fever, pyrexia, children, health economics, cost of illness, antibiotics, United Kingdom

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131 BACKGROUND

132

133 Fever is a common cause of presentation to paediatric emergency departments (EDs),¹ accounting for
134 ~20% of all visits;² but despite its frequent occurrence, the aetiology of fever is diverse.³ Most
135 children with fever will suffer from self-limiting viral illnesses, however viral, bacterial, and severe
136 bacterial infections (SBIs) may result in almost identical clinical presentations in infants; making
137 diagnosis based on presentation, history, and clinical judgement alone a difficult task.

138 While a clear focus of bacterial infection may be present with presentations of acute otitis media
139 (AOM) or urinary tract infection (UTI), occult bacteremia can also occur in children who appear
140 otherwise well, and fever without focus is a common presentation, particularly so in those aged <36
141 months.^{4,5,6} However, occurring in as few as 1% of febrile children^{4,5}, these 'hidden' bacterial
142 infections represent a needle in the haystack; and the challenge for clinicians is to accurately identify
143 children at risk of bacterial infections. While it is possible that they may resolve spontaneously, for
144 those in whom they do not, life-threatening and potentially life-changing complications can
145 develop,^{4,7,8} with adverse outcomes in each survivor of severe meningococcal disease resulting in
146 lifelong treatment costs of ~£1.3m.⁹

147

148 As a result, a cautious stepped approach to the management of the febrile child is common,
149 characterised by extended periods of observation, investigations, radiography, and the precautionary
150 use of antibiotics, often prior to definitive evidence of bacterial foci.¹⁰ Unfortunately, such
151 interventions are invasive, can be painful, and are likely to prolong a child's visit to the ED;
152 contributing to extended ED waiting times, and driving the use of scarce ED healthcare resources.

153

154 The test currently providing the greatest degree of certainty in diagnosing invasive bacterial
155 infections, the blood culture; typically takes 12-48 hours to provide results; has a sensitivity of just
156 30-40%¹¹, and a significant false positive rate due to contamination with commensal bacteria from the

157 skin and mucosal surfaces.¹² This limits the diagnostic utility of the blood culture to clinicians
158 required to make decisions concerning the management of the febrile child in real-time; which in turn
159 increases the importance of sufficient observation time, ~~repeated~~ blood/urine investigations and
160 clinical judgement.

161 With the potential over-treatment of febrile children on the one-hand, and the prospect of failing to
162 identify potentially life-threatening SBIs on the other; a lack of timely and reliable indicators of
163 febrile aetiology, coupled with a natural tendency for risk aversion when treating children, has
164 resulted in a substantial financial burden to healthcare systems worldwide. However, to date, just a
165 handful of studies, predominantly US-based and conducted between six and 25 years ago in young
166 children; have examined the economic impact of paediatric febrile illness.¹³⁻¹⁶

167

168 Using a bottom-up time-driven and activity-based costing model (TDABC), the aims of this research
169 were to (1) estimate the economic impact of managing febrile illness episodes in children of all ages
170 and presenting complaints, in an NHS paediatric ED setting, (2) to identify how management
171 practices and costs vary with factors including patient age, and the experience of treating clinicians,
172 and, (3) to provide insights regarding where any diagnostic advances currently under development,
173 including molecular diagnostics, protein biomarkers, and point-of-care (POC) testing technologies,
174 are likely to yield the greatest clinical and socioeconomic value, by reducing clinical uncertainty
175 increasing confidence to withhold antibiotics.

176

177

178 METHODS

179 Participants & Methods

180 This study applies time-driven activity-based costing (TDABC), a bottom-up approach to healthcare
181 costing, which maps pathways observed during routine clinical practice, identifies all points and
182 durations of interaction therein, and assigns time-dependent costs to each constituent. The costs of

183 non-time-dependent activities, including tariff-based ancillary investigations, are subsequently added
184 to provide a representative activity-weighted cost per completed treatment episode.

185 A total of 8,552 consecutive febrile children, with a temperature above 38°C at presentation, or below
186 38°C with an unverified parent-reported history of fever up to 3 days previous, were prospectively
187 identified. All children visited Alder Hey Children's NHS Foundation Trust, a large paediatric
188 specialist care provider in the North West of England, between 1st September 2012 and 31st August
189 2013. Children were excluded if (1) data concerning key components of their stay, including the
190 treatments provided, or healthcare personnel seen, were missing or incomplete, or (2) if there were
191 pre-existing medical conditions likely to modify ED care pathways from those of the average
192 'otherwise well' patient, including paediatric oncology patients.

193

194 A schematic of the clinical pathway used for this study is provided in Fig 1. Children were initially
195 seen by a qualified ED nurse who conducted an initial evaluation, using the Manchester Triage
196 System (MTS).¹⁷ MTS assessments follow a flow chart based on the patient's reason for contacting
197 the ED. The chart begins by identifying possible criteria indicating life-threatening conditions for the
198 patient, and if none of these conditions are present, the nurse continues along the flow chart asking
199 questions until the nurse assigns the patient an appropriate category. The nurse's experience can
200 contribute to the assessment, but on the other hand, the risk of the nurse missing serious conditions is
201 reduced because the flow chart forces the nurse to ask key questions and make vital inquiries.

202 Children were triaged as green 'standard', yellow 'urgent', orange 'very urgent' or red 'immediate
203 attention'. For several children, borderline 'yellow/red' or 'orange/red' categories were applied. This
204 was a result of uncertainty during triage, and such children had their MTS classification amended with
205 increased or reduced urgency following a second opinion with a nurse or clinician. Diagnostic
206 categories, defined as definite bacterial, probable bacterial or bacterial syndrome with low/no
207 inflammatory markers, definite viral, probable viral, or viral syndrome with no/high inflammatory
208 markers, trivial illness, inflammatory illness, and unknown/insufficient information, were applied
209 retrospectively, based on an adapted algorithm from Herberg et al.¹⁸ In any instance where uncertainty
210 or disagreement occurred regarding the appropriate classification, these cases were marked and

211 decided upon by two consultants specializing in paediatric infectious disease. All cases had notes,
212 including CRP, neutrophils and sterile site pathogenic bacteria recorded such that diagnosis
213 classifications could be quality checked, to ensure consistency. For this analysis, definite bacterial,
214 probable bacterial and bacterial syndromes with low/no inflammatory markers, were collectively
215 defined as ‘bacterial aetiologies’, while definite viral, probable viral, and viral syndromes with
216 no/high inflammatory markers were collectively defined as ‘viral aetiologies’. Like other studies,¹⁹ the
217 prescription of antibiotics for patients with anything other than a bacterial aetiology of fever, were for
218 this study, defined retrospectively as “potentially avoidable”.

219

220

221 Fig. 1: Clinical pathway of paediatric febrile illness used for patient-level costing

222

223

224

225 Because time stamps documenting the duration of contact with healthcare personnel for various
226 treatments and investigations are not routinely collected as part of NHS electronic patient records,
227 these were imputed in one of two ways. Firstly, estimates were provided by staff actively involved in
228 the provision of ED care. Secondly, prospective time-in-motion data were collected for a
229 representative cohort of 71 febrile children presenting to Alder Hey Children’s NHS Foundation Trust
230 ED between January 6th and February 12th, 2017. Four 5th year medical students collected the data by
231 ‘shadowing’ patients reporting to the book-in desk with fever as a symptom. Additionally, any
232 patients suspected of fever by clinical teams (such as the nurse performing initial visual assessment)
233 were additionally identified. The researchers followed patients through the ED, documenting all
234 points of interaction with healthcare professionals using a stopwatch and a pre-designed case report
235 form. Parental consent was obtained prior to data collection. Data were collected in four hourly blocks
236 during the day (8a.m-4p.m), evening (4p.m-12a.m) and early morning (12a.m-4a.m), seven days a
237 week. All children with a suspected fever were observed from the point of visual assessment, and
238 their experience in the ED, timed using a stopwatch and documented in Microsoft® Excel. For any

239 events which were not observed during implementation of the time-in-motion study, including clerical
 240 and administrative tasks such as writing up patient notes, these were estimated following a Delphi
 241 panel approach. In all such cases a number of estimates were obtained and the average time was used
 242 because tasks such as inserting a cannula for example, can be expected to take varying lengths of time
 243 depending upon factors such as experience, co-operation of the child, state of hydration or vascular
 244 filling. All timings used are provided in Table 1.

245

246 Table 1: Staff time associated with components of the paediatric febrile illness pathway

247

ACTIVITY	MEAN DURATION (MINS)
Triage time (Nurse)*	4.5
Clinician consultation time (MTS Green) *	16.2
Clinician consultation time (MTS Yellow) *	19.4
Clinician consultation time (MTS Orange) *	21.1
Clinician consultation time (MTS Red) *	22.7
Clinician time - Writing up patient notes#	10
Order blood/urine culture (Clinician)#	10
Arrange X-ray (Clinician)#	6
Book patient into the ED (Receptionist)#	2
Refer patient to other specialties (Clinician)#	20
Insert cannula (Clinician)*	20
Provide antibiotics/other medicines (Nurse)#	5
Visual assessment triage (Nurse)*	2

Interpret results of ancillary investigations (Clinician)#	10
*Collected during time-in-motion study # Estimate provided by ED consultants	

248

249

250 Unit costs

251 Hourly salaries for healthcare personnel were provided by the patient-level costing department at the
 252 Trust. Except for clinicians, salaries for those working either (1) weekdays between 7pm and 7a.m,
 253 or, (2) at the weekend, had their hourly rate increased in line with NHS guidance on working unsocial
 254 hours.²⁰ Costs for non-time driven activities, including laboratory-based investigations, were obtained
 255 from the Trust's finance department and NHS reference costs 2015/16.²¹

256 Pharmaceuticals were assigned unit costs from the British National Formulary. As data concerning
 257 the precise antibiotics provided to patients were not available, we assumed that antibiotic prescribing
 258 was in line with the recommendations provided within NICE CG160.²² Namely, where intravenous
 259 (IV) antibiotics were prescribed, both a third-generation cephalosporin (cefotaxime, ceftriaxone) and
 260 an anti-listeria agent were provided (amoxicillin, ampicillin) for infants under 1 month, and a third-
 261 generation cephalosporin alone if more than 1 month. In cases of empiric IV antibiotic therapy, it was
 262 assumed that a third-generation cephalosporin directed against *Neisseria meningitidis*, *Streptococcus*
 263 *pneumoniae*, *Escherichia coli*, *Staphylococcus aureus* and *Haemophilus influenzae type b* was
 264 provided. Where oral antibiotics were prescribed it was assumed that amoxicillin or cephalexin were
 265 provided as per local antimicrobial guidance.

266

267 Costs incurred during inpatient stay were obtained from NHS reference costs 2015/16. The tariff
 268 HRG PW20C (paediatric fever of unknown origin, CC score = 0) was utilised to reflect a 3-day short
 269 stay inpatient admission. As children could be admitted for anywhere between 1 and 72 hours under
 270 the reference tariff, this figure was divided through by 72 and multiplied by the number of hours of

271 inpatient admission. Patients who exceeded the three-day limit, incurred an excess bed day charge
272 which was applied from the fourth day until discharge.²¹ Finally, indirect costs were estimated for
273 each patient, using the ‘full absorption approach’. This included the anticipated use of facilities such
274 as toilets, and the time of administrative staff typing up and sending discharge notes to patient’s
275 general practitioners. Societal costs, including parental absence from work, and children’s absence
276 from school were not included, as the analysis was conducted from a healthcare provider perspective.
277 Due to the short time frame of the analysis, costs were not discounted. All unit costs were in 2017
278 prices and are provided within Table 2.

279

280 Table 2: Unit costs by component of paediatric febrile illness pathway

281

282 Outcomes & statistical analysis

283 We present summary statistics to describe the characteristics of participants. Categorical variables
284 were summarised by frequency and percentage, while continuous variables were reported as mean,
285 standard deviation (SD), median, interquartile range (IQR), minimum and maximum values. Our
286 primary outcome was the ‘cost per completed febrile illness episode’, with an ‘episode’ defined as the
287 period from booking in to the ED to final discharge, enabling the possibility for re-attendances to be
288 included. We additionally performed sub-group analyses to account for patient and healthcare
289 provider heterogeneity. As our primary outcome data were both non-normally distributed, and
290 characterised by sub-groups of unequal size, the Kruskal-Wallis test was applied to assess statistical
291 significance, with Dunn’s post-hoc pairwise comparison (adjusted by the Holm FWER method) used
292 to determine where significant differences were present. Results were reported as p-values and
293 considered statistically significant at the standard 5% level. Multivariate regression analysis using a
294 generalised linear model (GLM) was performed to estimate conditional mean health expenditure and
295 identify covariates associated with increased healthcare utilisation. Because several prior studies have
296 demonstrated that the gamma family with a log error link is not only robust, but also the most
297 commonly applied approach in healthcare cohorts in which positive and skewed healthcare costs are
298 guaranteed,^{23, 24} our analysis also assumed a gamma error distribution with log-link.

299 Finally, because all timings employed within the TDABC were estimates, and therefore subject to one
 300 or more of (1) sampling bias, (2) Hawthorne effects, or (3) reporting bias, a distribution of credible
 301 times for each patient interaction with healthcare personnel was used in the time-driven and activity-
 302 based costing, to reflect the uncertainty inherent to sampling. For all parameters contained within the
 303 time-driven and activity-based costing, continuous variables (time in consultation with clinician, days
 304 spent as inpatient) were randomly sampled from gamma distributions as explained by Briggs.²⁵
 305 Dichotomous variables (percentage of triage assessments performed by band 5/6 nurses) were
 306 sampled from representative beta distributions constructed from the sample data available, as
 307 explained in previous work by Briggs et al ²⁶. For estimates reliant on expert opinion, which were not
 308 observed during the time-in-motion study due to a low frequency of occurrence, uniform distributions
 309 were sampled in absence of information concerning the true sample mean and variance. In choosing
 310 this distribution we combined and ranked response data from all healthcare professionals (of varying
 311 roles and experience) surveyed, to define lower and upper limits or ‘bounding’ criterion. Once
 312 responses were provided, respondents were informed of responses by other respondents to gauge their
 313 belief in the credibility of different responses and ensure that the distributions utilized were plausible.
 314 GLM regression modelling was subsequently replicated for 100 bootstrapped costing datasets
 315 randomly utilizing parameter values from all plausible distributions, for all variables; to assess the
 316 sensitivity of the primary outcome, the cost per febrile illness episode, and the resulting GLM
 317 coefficients, to changes in the values of underlying input parameters. Details of all distributions
 318 utilized are provided in Table 3. All analyses were performed using STATA 14 (StataCorp LP, USA)
 319 and Microsoft® Excel™, (Redmond, WA).

320

321 Table 3: Distributions used for probabilistic sensitivity analysis

PARAMETER	DISTRIBUTION
TIME (HOURS)	
Nurse triage	Gamma (4.69, 0.01)
Proportion performed by band 6 nurses	Beta (16,55)

Proportion performed by band 5 nurses	1- Beta (16,55)
Clinical consultation	Gamma (3.9, 0.04)
Clinician writing up patient notes	Uniform (1,20)
Arrange blood/urine culture	Uniform (1,25)
Arranging X-ray	Uniform (1,30)
Receptionist booking patient in	Uniform (1,5)
Clinician arranging referral	Uniform (1,25)
Clinician cannulating child	Uniform (5,35)
Nurse providing antibiotics to child	Uniform (1,10)
Visual assessment by nurse	Uniform (0.5,5)
Days spent as inpatient (if admitted)	Gamma (3.72, 1.03)
SALARY (COST/HOUR)	
Nurse (band 5)	Uniform (13.36,17.5)
Nurse (band 6)	Uniform (16.14,21.77)
Nurse (band 7)	Uniform (19.34,25.67)
Nurse (band 8a)	Uniform (24.8,29.99)
Foundation year doctor	Uniform (22.5,26)
ST1-3	Uniform (27, 30.8)
APNP	Uniform (24.8,29.99)
Registrar	Uniform (36,41)
Consultant	Uniform (64.8,87.4)

322

323 RESULTS

324 Descriptive statistics

325 8,552 individual ED attendances were identified over the study period, with 2,034 excluded from the
326 analysis due to incomplete data or failing to meet our inclusion criteria. This resulted in a complete
327 dataset of 6,518 observations (Table 4). **There was no significant difference in observable**
328 **characteristics between those included and excluded; including but not limited to age, final diagnoses,**
329 **MTS classification and temperature.**

330 Table 4: Descriptive statistics of study participants

331

332 The mean (median) age of children included was 3.28 (2.17) years, with 53.5% male and 46.5%
333 female. At presentation, 47.52% of children were triaged as green ‘low risk’ cases using the
334 Manchester Triage System (MTS),¹⁷ 8.88% as yellow, 0.17% as yellow/red, 17.06% as orange,
335 23.03% as orange/red and 0.39% as red (high risk). MTS classifications were not recorded in 2.9% of
336 patients. Most patients (66.32%) were treated by specialty doctors (ST1-3), followed by registrars or
337 ST4-8 (22.05%), consultants (7.99%), APNPs (2.73%), and Foundation year 1 & 2 doctors (0.91%).
338 The mean (median) time was 15.3 (14.7 mins) between booking and triage, 67.9 (52 mins) between
339 triage and clinical consultation, and 68.4 (70.6 mins) between consultation and discharge. Total mean
340 (median) time in the ED was 151.6 mins (81.3 mins). Approximately 6.46% of patients were admitted
341 as inpatients, 1.42% of which for a single day, 29.78% (two days), 21.51% (three days), and 47.28%
342 (> four days).

343

344 Determinants of patient-level costs

345 Table 5 provides details of patient-level resource use and costing. Those aged 0-3 months exhibited a
346 mean treatment cost of £1000.28, [95% CI £82.89-£2,993.37], over 6-fold higher than the least costly
347 group, aged 3-6 years, (£158.97, [95% CI £20.43-£1,596.43]). Use of blood cultures (p=0.0312),
348 urine samples, inpatient admission rates, and inpatient length of stay (p=0.0001) were all statistically
349 significantly increased for those aged 0-3 months, versus all other age groups, as shown in Table 6.

350

351 Table 5: Health service costs of paediatric febrile illness by sub-group

352

353

354

355

356

357

358 Table 6: Health service utilisation by patient age and MTS score

359

	INPATIENT	LENGTH OF STAY (DAYS)[#]	ANY TEST	BLOOD CULTURE	X-RAY	URINE SAMPLE	REVIEW BY CONSULTANT
AGE							
0-3 months	34.11%	5.67	51.16%	28.70%	9.30%	39.53%	10.07%
3-6 months	15.66%	5.34	40.92%	11.03%	12.10%	32.74%	5.69%
6-12 months	6.34%	3.83	31.98%	2.01%	9.12%	23.24%	8.64%
1-3 years	5.36%	4.05	29.74%	2.52%	10.88%	18.37%	7.64%
3-6 years	4.01%	4.02	28.70%	3.03%	9.43%	13.70%	8.14%
6-10 years	4.53%	3.78	34.08%	3.67%	9.61%	17.25%	8.76%
10-16 years	7.96%	4.73	42.22%	8.88%	10.15%	15.87%	7.3%
<i>P-value</i>	0.0001 [§]	0.0001 [*]	0.0001 [§]	0.0001 [§]	0.5370 [§]	0.0001 [§]	0.1342 [§]
MTS CLASSIFICATION							
Green	2.61%	3.88	24.59%	1.51%	5.68%	16.17%	8.06%
Yellow	13.64%	4.64	43.52%	7.42%	11.91%	23.48%	9.32%
Orange	17.27%	4.23	44.6%	10.07%	23.2%	19.15%	8.45%
Red	30.77%	2.63	26.92%	15.38%	11.53%	11.53%	23.07%
<i>P-value</i>	0.0001 [§]	0.0001 [#]	0.0001 [§]	0.0001 [§]	0.0001 [§]	0.0023 [§]	
[#] Mean length of stay among those admitted for at least one day [*] Kruskal-Wallis test [§] Chi-squared test							

360

361

362 The distribution of MTS classifications was approximately equal across all age-groups, except for
 363 those aged 0-3months, 74.41% of which were triaged as yellow or higher. As expected, overall
 364 healthcare expenditure increased with increasing MTS severity, from £121.78 per patient (green),
 365 £424.43 (yellow), £487.16 (orange), and £549.42 (red); the majority of which as a direct result of

366 increasing rates of inpatient admission. A one-step increase in triage category, from green to yellow,
367 resulted in a 422% increase in inpatient admission, a 19.6% increase in length of stay for those
368 admitted, and a 391% increase in use of blood cultures. In terms of final diagnoses, bacterial
369 infections were most commonly observed in those aged 0-3 months (15.5%), 3-6months (11.03%) and
370 10-16 years (11.74%), however the only significant difference was when comparing these groups to
371 those aged 1-3 years (4.6%), $p < 0.05$. Those with bacterial aetiologies of fever exhibited over 3-fold
372 higher management costs than those with viral aetiologies (£988.19 vs. £294.52).

373

374

375 Antibiotic prescribing patterns

376

377 Approximately 32.4% of febrile children were prescribed antibiotics, of whom 7.05% were
378 retrospectively diagnosed with bacterial aetiologies of fever. Approximately 14.9% of patients
379 retrospectively classified as having inflammatory, 10.8% as trivial, and 6.6% as viral aetiologies of
380 fever (probable, definite and viral syndromes), were prescribed potentially avoidable antibiotics, if a
381 means of distinguishing these from bacterial causes of infection been available. Analysing children
382 with viral causes of fever who were triaged as MTS green or yellow (those not deemed to require very
383 urgent or immediate care); those receiving antibiotics spent an additional 53.9 hours as inpatients
384 (57.1 vs. 3.2hours) compared to children with viral aetiologies of fever, triaged MTS green or yellow,
385 who were not prescribed antibiotics. This resulted in a 9.9-fold increase in management costs for
386 those who received potentially avoidable antibiotics (£1,392.30 vs. £140.10) as shown in Table 8; the
387 majority of which attributable to the costs of inpatient or short stay beds for observation.

388

389

390

391

392 Table 7: Antibiotic prescribing rates differentiated by age and final diagnosis

393

RECEIVING ANTIBIOTICS									P- VALUE#
TOTAL	0-3 MONTHS	3-6 MONTHS	6-12 MONTHS	1-3 YEARS	3-6 YEARS	6-10 YEARS	10-16 YEARS		
All	32.4%	27.9%	24.2%	24%	31.9%	37%	34.5%	40.3%	0.0001
Bacterial	89.6%	85%	96.8%	84.3%	93%	89%	87.7%	91.9%	0.3610
Viral	6.6%	20.8%	10%	3.2%	9.4%	4%	2.60%	5.7%	0.0001
Inflammatory	14.9%	0%	0%	0%	9.5%	17.2%	23.1%	12.5%	0.9330
Trivial	10.8%	0%	50%	0%	9.7%	8.1%	20%	5.3%	0.0820
Unknown	36.4%	17.3%	19.2%	25.5%	35.7%	43.3%	42.2%	48.1%	0.0001

Chi-squared test

394

395

396 Table 8: Treatment costs differentiated by age, final diagnosis and antibiotic status

397

ANTIBIOTICS GIVEN?	VIRAL		TRIVIAL		INFLAMMATORY		BACTERIAL	
	YES	NO	YES	NO	YES	NO	YES	NO
All*	£1,392.30	£140.10	£324.49	£224.54	£185.08	£669.86	£755.03	£747.43
0-3 months	£2,842.60	£479.65	N/A	£113.81	N/A	£50.87	£2,476.96	£2,419.07
3-6 months	£1,969.38	£142.81	£50.39	£334.50	N/A	£65.92	£1,078.39	£60.78
6-12 months	£2,452.83	£159.57	N/A	£58.63	N/A	N/A	£376.20	£774.53
1-3 years	£687.02	£151.09	£2,223.43	£256.88	£51.43	£390.81	£883.52	£278.09
3-6 years	£1,201.76	£123.97	£58.69	£196.88	£54.52	£355.06	£450.45	£586.77
6-10 years	£1,575.80	£63.65	£51.46	£87.65	£475.93	£447.47	£416.84	£672.95
10-16 years	£2,603.54	£143.37	N/A	£401.88	£101.95	£4,842.32	£1,484.10	£694.91

*MTS green and yellow only

398

399

400 Determinants of increased healthcare expenditure during paediatric febrile episodes

401

402 Based on generalized linear modelling, compared to the reference group of those aged 1-3years, those
403 aged 0-3 months, experienced a 3.54-fold [95% CI 2.59-4.85-fold, $p<0.0001$] increase in healthcare
404 resource use. The presence of a NICE NG51 respiratory rate red flag,²⁷ increased costs by 72.1%
405 ($p<0.0001$) (Table 6). Other factors associated with increased resource use included treatment by
406 FY1/FY2 doctors, which were increased 3.19-fold, relative to the consultant reference group,
407 $p<0.0001$. When considering only non-urgent children, triaged as Green using the MTS, FY1/FY2
408 doctors exhibited a 7.98-fold increase in costs of management, relative to consultants ($p<0.0001$).
409 FY1/FY2 doctors recorded the highest rates of inpatient admission, ancillary investigations, and
410 referring children to other specialties. Comparing resource use for FY1/FY2 doctors working out-of-
411 hours and those working during regular hours, where the availability of ancillary investigations may
412 be reduced, there was no significant difference ($p=0.9626$). Factors including male gender, and being
413 treated by an APNP, were shown to reduce costs by 15.1% ($p=0.0241$), and 42.7% ($p=0.0112$)
414 respectively, as shown in Table 9.

415

416 Table 9: Determinants of healthcare resource use for paediatric febrile episodes

417

418 Increasing clinical severity, as proxied by increasing MTS classifications, resulted in significant cost
419 increases of 138.2% (2.38-fold), 185.7% (2.85 fold) and 199.2% (2.99-fold) respectively compared to
420 children triaged as green, (all $p<0.01$). As such, we performed independent GLM regressions for three
421 MTS groups (green, yellow and orange/red), to account for the possibility that severity of illness may
422 have an important role in determining overall resource use. Similar to the results when pooling
423 children of all severities, those demonstrated in Figure 2 highlight the consistent importance of ages
424 (<6 months, 10-16 years), prompting a NICE respiratory rate red flag²⁷, and being treated by an FY1
425 or FY2 doctor, suggesting that these are key drivers of increased resource use when managing
426 paediatric febrile illness after taking clinical severity into account.

427

428 Figure 2: Determinants of healthcare resource use among febrile children of differing clinical
429 risk/urgency

430 Sensitivity analysis

431 Our findings were insensitive to changes in the values of our input parameters. Following Monte
432 Carlo simulation and re-running our generalized linear models on 100 bootstrapped datasets, the
433 coefficients listed in Table 10 were obtained. Children triaged as MTS Yellow or above, those
434 prompting a NICE NG51 respiratory rate red flag, those treated by an FY1/FY2 doctor, and treatment
435 of children aged 0-3 months, 3-6 months or 10-16 years respectively, were statistically significant
436 predictors of increased healthcare costs in 100% of simulations. Conversely, the cost savings
437 associated with male gender and treatment by an APNP, remained significant in just 8% and 28.3% of
438 simulations respectively.

439

440 Table 10: Sensitivity analyses of determinants of healthcare costs for paediatric febrile episodes

441

442 DISCUSSION

443 This study reports the largest comprehensive, prospective observational study to date, assessing the
444 economic implications of diagnostic uncertainty when managing paediatric febrile illness, in those
445 aged 0-16 years, in an ED setting. In a full cohort analysis on the management of this highly common
446 condition, we demonstrate that the healthcare resources required to manage this condition are both
447 significant and subject to extensive variation, some of which can be explained by the presence of
448 certain patient and healthcare provider characteristics. Infants aged 0-6 months (particularly those
449 aged 0-3 months), those triaged as MTS yellow or above, and those managed by lesser experienced
450 clinicians (FY1 and FY2), required significantly greater resources in the ED. This was primarily a
451 result of increases in observation time for patients and inpatient length of stay, the latter particularly
452 prominent in those receiving antibiotics. In cases of MTS green and yellow viral infections, where
453 antibiotics were potentially avoidable had more sensitive and prompt diagnostics been available at
454 this time, costs increased 9.9-fold (95% CI 6.48-13.2-fold). This was equivalent to an additional
455 £1,352.20 spend per patient (all patients pooled), rising to £2,363 for infants aged less than three
456 months.

457

458 Our study had several strengths. We included more than 6,500 febrile children over all seasons during
459 a one-year period, and by applying TDABC methodology we could achieve significant detail
460 regarding actual resource use. This resulted in an inclusive and representative estimate of the
461 economic impact of paediatric febrile illness to NHS EDs. Capturing model input data using a
462 prospective time-in-motion approach provided confidence regarding the time requirements of
463 essential components of care in the patient pathway. Data regarding these patient touchpoints are not
464 currently available in published literature, and we believe this analysis has filled a gap which may
465 subsequently be used for similar health-economic analyses in the future.

466

467 Limitations of our study include the fact that presumed viral and bacterial aetiologies of fever were
468 applied retrospectively, therefore we lacked the benefit of clinical acumen and parental anxiety which
469 could heavily influence the decision to prescribe antibiotics. While we made every effort to minimize
470 bias when coding final diagnoses using the algorithm provided by Herberg et al.¹⁸ there is a possibility
471 that errors could have occurred, which may have affected conclusions regarding potentially avoidable
472 antibiotics in the event of an incorrect diagnosis. However, following random sampling and checking
473 of diagnoses we believe the likelihood of this to be minimal given the level of detail provided and
474 simplicity in using the diagnosis algorithm. Another potential limitation is the completeness of the
475 dataset, with just under 24% of observations removed due to missing or incomplete data. While it was
476 assumed that these data were missing at random, we cannot be sure of this, and as such we are unsure
477 how the results may have differed if data for these 2,034 children were available. While we made
478 every effort to ensure a thorough approach to capturing NHS resource use, there were also instances
479 where we likely underestimated costs. Our time-in-motion data did not capture information regarding
480 additional consultations and advice from senior members of staff, which are likely to increase the
481 costs of lesser experienced clinicians managing febrile children; nor did it include the societal costs of
482 febrile illness borne by parents, including time off work, especially in the case of hospitalisation.
483 Considering that new diagnostics may result in a reduction in antibiotic use, it is plausible that
484 reattendances or time observing patients in the department could increase, thereby potentially

485 reducing the value to parents of improved diagnostics. The final limitation of our study concerns the
486 generalizability of the findings to other settings, whether in the United Kingdom, Europe or further
487 afield. Our data were collected from a single site, and our analysis based on local prescribing
488 protocols, as such, the economic value of improving the management of febrile illness in other
489 settings, including the United States, where a more consultant-led approach may be more
490 common, may differ from those demonstrated here.

491

492 Two previous studies have reported healthcare costs for managing children with SBIs, namely UTI,¹³
493 and meningitis.¹⁴ Two studies reporting costs of management for children with fever of any cause,^{15,16}
494 have been performed in the USA, with data collected at least 5 years ago, in children aged <3 years
495 and <90 days respectively, thereby limiting their generalisability. Additionally, one study conducted
496 in Switzerland demonstrates the cost-of-illness associated with paediatric community acquired
497 pneumonia in 2010²⁸. However, no study prior to ours has assessed the resource implications of
498 managing fever in a broad and representative cohort of all ages, diagnoses, and types of resource use
499 in Europe.

500

501 The finding that infants (particularly those aged <3months) tended to require significantly greater ED
502 resources, may be explained by increased cautiousness, and a lack of symptomatic information
503 directly from the children themselves, when managing febrile infants. Despite most causes of fever in
504 children being self-limiting, the fear of missing life-threatening infection in children with fever
505 remains a persistent problem for clinicians, who have a natural tendency to be risk-averse.²

506 Commonly reported concerns among clinicians treating febrile children include suspected central
507 nervous system damage (24%), seizures (19%), and death (5%),³⁰ manifesting in overly aggressive,
508 and often, in hindsight, unnecessary treatment.³¹ Additionally, the prevalence of invasive bacterial
509 infections, bacteraemia and bacterial meningitis, are highest in the first 3 months of life, driving
510 clinician behaviour towards a cautious approach in this high-risk group. **Clinical prediction rules, such**
511 **as the Yale observation scale may be useful in these groups, particularly among those with less**
512 **experience in ruling in/out serious bacterial infections; however, reliability in higher³² vs. lower**

513 income countries³³ is variable, suggesting that these alone, may not be enough to fill the diagnostic
514 gap faced by the clinician managing paediatric febrile illness³⁴.

515

516 Though potentially avoidable antibiotic prescribing was lower in our cohort (6.6% viral, 10.8% trivial
517 illness) than in similar studies based in the United States (36%),³⁵ and Oxford, England (34%)³⁶, we
518 found that antibiotic prescribing for those with viral causes of fever was highest in those aged 0-3
519 (20.8%), and 3-6 months (10%) supporting our finding of an increased tendency to be cautious when
520 treating young febrile infants. This resulted not only in a substantial increase in ED resource use, but
521 also likely increased inconvenience and distress to the children and parents involved, due to
522 potentially unnecessary investigations and treatment. Furthermore, excess use of antibiotics is known
523 to contribute to increasing rates of antimicrobial resistance (AMR),³⁷ an important component of both
524 the clinical and economic impact of AB prescribing which we were unable to quantify in this analysis.

525

526 Given the paucity of published evidence, additional research examining the patient-centred and
527 societal implications of current diagnosis and treatment practices when managing the febrile child,
528 would add considerable value for those looking to determine the true value of improved diagnostics,
529 which may be capable of better targeting of scarce ED resources. Given the variable performance and
530 accuracy of the MTS triage system in paediatric populations, we believe our finding that costs
531 increased with MTS severity is noteworthy. Recent large-scale validation studies have highlighted the
532 low reliability of the MTS in both younger,¹⁷ and older children presenting to the ED with fever,³⁸
533 with an estimated 54% of children over-triaged when using the MTS.³⁴ In adult studies, over-triaging
534 by just a single category, from green to yellow, has been shown to increase the use of
535 electrocardiogram (ECG) and laboratory investigations by 261% and 148% respectively.³⁹ Similarly,
536 in our study, children triaged as yellow experienced a 422% increase in inpatient stay, a 76.9%
537 increase in ancillary investigations, and a 15.6% increase in review by consultants, versus those
538 triaged as green. As the MTS categories yellow, orange and red represent urgent, very urgent and
539 immediate attention respectively, these are the groups with the highest probability of SBIs, we believe
540 these are the groups where novel diagnostics should be targeted.

541

542 While we found evidence of an increase in healthcare utilisation among the least experienced
543 clinicians (FY1/FY2), just 0.9% of clinicians included in our study were FY1 and FY2 doctors. The
544 results observed in this sample were therefore highly susceptible to bias through a lack of inter-
545 clinician variability, and with a larger sample size may regress towards a lower mean. Additionally,
546 although GLM analyses highlighted a 44.2% increase in time spent in the ED for those treated by FY1
547 and FY2 doctors when compared to consultants, this was likely due to the need to seek second
548 opinions from more experienced colleagues, something which we were unable to attach costs to. This
549 may also have been because lower acuity patients wait the longest and are more likely to be seen by
550 lesser experienced doctors, as the sickest are re-directed to senior doctors. Because it is likely that any
551 advances in diagnostics are likely to be heavily used by lesser experienced doctors, this could reduce
552 times in the ED, but potentially still increase management costs. This is particularly true if the price of
553 novel POC tests is high, as with multiplex PCR, which may cost the same as a day in hospital when
554 first released. The price of such tests can however be expected to decrease over time, resulting in
555 savings over the longer-term.

556

557 CONCLUSIONS

558 In conclusion, based on a comprehensive and representative sample of febrile children of varying age,
559 presenting complaints, final diagnoses and treating clinicians, this study has shown that the
560 management of paediatric febrile illness in the ED poses a substantial financial burden. This is
561 predominantly due to impact of diagnostic uncertainty, that most often leads to in increased
562 observation time and inpatient admission. Children aged 0-6 months, those triaged as MTS yellow
563 and above, and those managed by newly qualified doctors are the most likely to receive additional
564 resources in the ED. After accounting for the severity of illness, precautionary antibiotic prescribing,
565 particularly in younger low acuity children with viral illnesses, is associated with substantial increases
566 in health service utilization, **predominantly because of increases in inpatient admissions**. So far,
567 information on potential shifts in infection epidemiology, such as an increase in health care-

568 associated infections or reductions in vaccine –preventable infections or increases in invasive disease
569 due to serotype replacement are unlikely to affect our conclusions. Comparable settings in the United
570 Kingdom and elsewhere will likely show similar patterns in resource use. Any advances in diagnostic
571 capabilities, including molecular diagnostics, protein biomarkers and POC tests would likely yield the
572 potentially greatest efficiency gains in these groups of children, as among these the perceived risks of
573 untimely diagnosis are greatest.

574

575

576 FIGURES

577 Fig. 1: Clinical pathway of paediatric febrile illness used for patient-level costing

578 Fig 2: Determinants of healthcare resource use among febrile children of differing clinical

579 risk/urgency

580

581 ADDITIONAL FILES

582 There are no additional files.

583

584

585 ABBREVIATIONS

586 95% CI 95% Confidence interval

587 AB Antibiotic

588 AOM Acute otitis media

589 APNP Advanced paediatric nurse practitioner

590 CRP C-reactive protein

591	ECG	Electro cardiogram
592	ED	Emergency department
593	FY1/FY2	Foundation year 1/ foundation year 2
594	GLM	Generalised linear model
595	IQR	Interquartile range
596	MTS	Manchester triage system
597	NHS	National health service
598	NICE	National institute for health and care excellence
599	POC	Point of care
600	SBI	Serious bacterial infection
601	SD	Standard deviation
602	ST1-3	Specialised training years 1-3
603	TDABC	Time-driven and activity-based costing
604	USA	United States of America
605	UTI	Urinary tract infection

606

607 DECLARATIONS

608 Ethics approval and consent to participate

609 Ethical approval was the study was granted by North West 9 Research Ethics Committee

610 REC reference number: 10/H1014/53.

611

612 Consent for publication

613 Not applicable

614

615 Availability of data and materials

616 The data that support the findings of this study are available from the authors upon
617 reasonable request.

618

619 Competing interests

620 The authors declare that they have no competing interests

621

622 Funding

623 SL is funded by a studentship from the Institute of Infection and Global Health, The University of
624 Liverpool and the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant
625 agreement No. 668303 (PERFORM study (Personalised Risk assessment in Febrile illness to
626 Optimise Real-life Management across the European Union). The study sponsors had no involvement
627 in the formation of the research questions nor the analysis itself.

628

629 Authors' contributions

630 EDC and LN devised the study and will act as guarantors for the paper), AG supervised collection of
631 data, EH, NM, LH, JBM, NMOC, YR, SS, SD and HD helped collect data. SL, BF and FC planned
632 and performed all statistical analyses, with SL conducting all costings and data cleaning. JD collected
633 costing data and KE collected additional electronic patient data. SL wrote the first draft of the
634 manuscript and revised and approved the final manuscript as submitted. All authors helped draft the
635 manuscript and approved the final submitted version.

636

637 Acknowledgements

638 We thank the children and their parents for participating in the study, and ED staff for their
639 considerable contribution to the study.

640

641 REFERENCES

- 642 [1] Krauss BS, Harakal T, Fleisher, GR. The spectrum and frequency of illness presenting to a
643 pediatric emergency department,” *Pediatr Emerg Care* 1991; 7(2): 67–71.
- 644 [2] Alpern ER, Henretig FM. Fever. Fleisher GR, Ludwig S, Textbook of paediatric emergency
645 medicine. 5th edition, Philadelphia 2006; 295–306,
- 646 [3] Limper M, Eeftinck Schattenkerk D, de Kruif MD, van Wissen M, Brandjes DP, Duits AJ, et
647 al. One-year epidemiology of fever at the emergency department, *Netherlands J Med* 2011; 69 (3):
648 124–8.
- 649 [4] Irwin, AD, Drew, RJ, Marshall, P, et al. Etiology of childhood bacteremia and timely
650 antibiotics administration in the emergency department. *Pediatrics* 2015; 135, 4:635-42.
- 651 [5] Gangoiti, I, Rodriguez, E, Zubizarreta, et al. Prevalence of Occult Bacteremia in Infants With
652 Very High Fever Without a Source. *Pediatr. Infect. Dis. J.*, 2018; 37, 11
- 653 [6] Irwin, AD, Grant, A, Williams, R, et al. Predicting Risk of Serious Bacterial Infections in
654 Febrile Children in the Emergency Department. *Pediatrics*, 2017; 140, 2
- 655 [7] Mejer, N, Westh, H, Schönheyder, HC, et al. Stable incidence and continued improvement in
656 short term mortality of *Staphylococcus aureus* bacteraemia between 1995 and 2008. *BMC Infect. Dis*
657 2012; 12:260.
- 658 [8] Ladhani S, Pebody RG, Ramsay ME, et al. Continuing impact of infectious diseases on
659 childhood deaths in England and Wales, 2003-2005. *Pediatr Infect Dis J.* 2010; 29(4):310–313
- 660 [9] Wright C, Wordsworth R, Glennie L. Counting the cost of meningococcal disease: Scenarios
661 of severe meningitis and septicemia, *Paediatr Drugs* 2013; 15 (1):49–58
- 662 [10] Nijman RG, Vergouwe Y, Thompson M, van Veen M, van Meurs AH, van der Lei J, et al.
663 Clinical prediction model to aid emergency doctors managing febrile children at risk of serious
664 bacterial infections: diagnostic study, *BMJ* 2013; 346: f1706
- 665 [11] Martín-Torres F, Salas A, Rivero-Calle I, et al. EUCLIDS Consortium. Life-threatening
666 infections in children in Europe (the EUCLIDS Project): a prospective cohort study. *Lancet Child*
667 *Adolesc Health.* 2018 Jun; 2(6):404-414.
- 668 [12] Weddle G, Jackson MA, Selvarangan R. Reducing blood culture contamination in a pediatric
669 emergency department, *Pediatr Emerg Care* 2011; 27 (3):179–81

670 [13] Hoberman A, Wald ER, Hickey RW, Baskin M, Charron M, Majd M, et al. Oral versus initial
671 intravenous therapy for urinary tract infections in young febrile children, *Pediatrics* 1999; 104 (1):
672 79–86

673 [14] Bell JM, Shields MD, Agus A, Dunlop K, Bourke T, Kee F, et al. Clinical and Cost-
674 Effectiveness of Procalcitonin Test for Prodromal Meningococcal Disease-A Meta-Analysis, *PLoS*
675 *One* 2015; 10 (6): e0128993.

676 [15] Byington CL, Reynolds CC, Korgenski K, Sheng X, Valentine KJ, Nelson RE, et al. Costs
677 and infant outcomes after implementation of a care process model for febrile infants, *Pediatrics* 2012;
678 130 (1) e16-24

679 [16] Schriger DL, Baraff LJ, Buller K, Shendrikar MA, Nagda S, Lin EJ, et al. Implementation of
680 clinical guidelines via a computer charting system: effect on the care of febrile children less than three
681 years of age, *J Am Med Inf. Assoc* 2000; 7(2): 186–95
682

683 [17] Zachariasse JM, Seiger N, Rood PPM, Alves CF, Freitas P, Smit FJ, et al. Validity of the
684 Manchester Triage System in emergency care: A prospective observational study, *PLoS One*
685 2017;12(2): e0170811

686 [18] Herberg JA, Kaforou M, Wright VJ, Shailes H, Eleftherohorinou H, Hoggart CJ, et al.
687 Diagnostic Test Accuracy of a 2-Transcript Host RNA Signature for Discriminating Bacterial vs Viral
688 Infection in Febrile Children, *JAMA* 2016; 316 (8):835–45

689 [19] Elfving K, Shakely D, Andersson M, Baltzell K, Ali AS, Bachelard M, et al. Acute
690 Uncomplicated Febrile Illness in Children Aged 2-59 months in Zanzibar - Aetiologies, Antibiotic
691 Treatment and Outcome.,” *PLoS One* 2016; 11: 1:e0146054

692 [20] NHS Employers: Unsocial hours payments - Section 2(a) (England), 2017. Available at:
693 [http://www.nhsemployers.org/your-workforce/pay-and-reward/agenda-for-change/nhs-terms-and-](http://www.nhsemployers.org/your-workforce/pay-and-reward/agenda-for-change/nhs-terms-and-conditions-of-service-handbook/unsocial-hours-payments)
694 [conditions-of-service-handbook/unsocial-hours-payments](http://www.nhsemployers.org/your-workforce/pay-and-reward/agenda-for-change/nhs-terms-and-conditions-of-service-handbook/unsocial-hours-payments). Accessed 8th August 2017

695 [21] Gov.uk NHS Reference Costs 2015/16. 2016.Available:
696 <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/nhs-reference-costs-2015-to-2016>. Accessed 11th April
697 2017

- 698 [22] NICE CG160: Fever in under 5s: Assessment and initial management, 2017
- 699 [23] Hardin JW, Hilbe JM. Generalized Linear Models and Extensions. 2nd Stata Press; College
700 Station (TX): 2007.
- 701 [24] Manning WG, Basu A, Mullahy J. Technical working paper 293: Generalized modelling
702 approaches to risk adjustment of skewed outcomes data. In: National bureau of economic research,
703 technical working paper series. 2003. <http://www.nber.org/papers/T0293>. Accessed 18 Feb 2016.
- 704 [25] Briggs, AH. Probabilistic analysis of cost-effectiveness models: statistical representation of
705 parameter uncertainty. *Value in Health*. 2005; 8(1)
- 706 [26] Briggs A, Sculpher M, Claxton K. Decision modelling for health economic evaluation. 3rd
707 ed. Oxford 2006.
- 708 [27] NICE NG51: Sepsis: recognition, diagnosis and early management, 2017
- 709 [28] Keitel, K, Alcoba, G, Lacroix, L, Manzano, S, Galetto-Lacour, A, Gervaix, A. Observed costs
710 and health care use of children in a prospective cohort study on community-acquired pneumonia in
711 Geneva, Switzerland. *Swiss Med Wkly*. 2014;144.
- 712 [29] Gunduz S, Usak E, Koksall T, Canbal M. Why Fever Phobia Is Still Common?, *Iran Red*
713 *Crescent Med J* 2016; 18 (8): e23827
- 714 [30] Crocetti M, Moghbeli N, Serwint J. Fever phobia revisited: have parental misconception
715 about fever changed in 20 years? *Pediatrics* 2001; 107 (6): 1241–6
- 716 [31] Elkon-Tamir E, Rimon A, Scolnik D, Glatstein, M. Fever Phobia as a Reason for Pediatric
717 Emergency Department Visits: Does the Primary Care Physician Make a Difference? *Rambam*
718 *Maimonides Med J* 2017; 8 (1)
- 719 [32] Nigrovic, LE, Mahajan, PV, Blumberg, SM, et al. The Yale Observation Scale Score and the
720 Risk of Serious Bacterial Infections in Febrile Infants. *Pediatrics*, 2017; 140: np
- 721 [33] Bang, A, Chaturvedi, P. Yale Observation Scale for prediction of bacteremia in febrile
722 children. *Indian J Pediatr* 2009; 76, 6:599-604.
- 723 [34] Thompson, M, Van den Bruel, A, Verbakel, J. Systematic review and validation of prediction
724 rules for identifying children with serious infections in emergency departments and urgent-access
725 primary care. *Health Technol Assess*, 2012; 16, 15:1-100.

726 [35] Wilkes JJ, Leckerman KH, Coffin SE, Keren R, Metjian TA, Hodinka RL. Use of antibiotics
727 in children hospitalized with community-acquired, laboratory-confirmed influenza., J Pediatr 2009;
728 154 (3): 447–9

729 [36] Harnden, A, Perera, R, Brueggemann, AB, Mayon-White, R, Crook, DW, Thomson, A, et al.
730 Respiratory infections for which general practitioners consider prescribing an antibiotic: a prospective
731 study. Arch. Dis. Child. 2007; 92, 7: 594-7.

732 [37] Bryce A, Hay AD, Lane IF, Thornton HV, Wootton M, Costelloe C. Global prevalence of
733 antibiotic resistance in paediatric urinary tract infections caused by Escherichia coli and association
734 with routine use of antibiotics in primary care: systematic review and meta-analysis,” BMJ 2016; 352:
735 i939

736 [38] van Veen M, Steyerberg EW, Ruige M, van Meurs AH, Roukema J, van der Lei J, et al.
737 Manchester triage system in paediatric emergency care: prospective observational study, BMJ 2008;
738 337: a1501

739 [39] Santos AP, Freitas P, Martins HM, Manchester Triage System version II and resource
740 utilisation in the emergency department, J Emerg Med 2014; 31 (2): 148–52

741

742

743

744

745

746

747

748

749

750 **TABLES**

751 Table 2: Unit costs by component of paediatric febrile illness pathway

752

ITEM	UNIT COST
INVESTIGATIONS (PER TEST)	
Amylase	£6.00
Bacterial PCR	£158.00
Bilirubin	£6.00
Biochemistry Profile	£8.00
Blood albumin	£6.00
Blood glucose test	£6.00
Blood Culture	£35.00
Blood gas #	£7.00
Blood taken	£3.00
Calcium profile	£7.00
Clotting screen	£5.00
Creatinine	£6.00
CRP	£6.00
CSF	£6.00
CT scan (Head)	£201.00
ECG	£33.00
ENT Swab	£19.00
ESR	£4.00
FBC	£3.00
Glandular fever screen	£4.00
Group and save	£12.00
LFTs	£7.00

Magnesium	£6.00
Malarial parasites test	£21.00
Measles PCR	£55.00
Meningo pneumo PCR	£25.00
Meningococci screen	£6.00
Mycoplasma SER	£23.00
Pertussis swab	£9.00
Phosphate	£6.00
Rapid Strep Test	£9.00
Renal profile	£46.00
Respiratory PCR	£117.00
RSV screen	£12.00
Ultrasound	£55.00
Urinalysis #	£8.00
Urine albumin	£6.00
Urine culture #	£8.00
Urine dipstick #	£6.00
Urine Sample	£8.53
Virus PCR	£56.00
X-ray	£46.00
ANTIBIOTICS (PER DOSE/COURSE)	
Amoxicillin 125mg (Suspended) *	£1.16
Amoxicillin 125mg (IV) *	£4.34
Amoxicillin 250mg (Susp.) *	£1.33
Cefotaxime 195mg (IV) *	£0.48
Cefotaxime 575mg (IV) *	£0.66
NURSE TIME (PER HOUR)	

Band 5	£15.43
Band 6	£18.95
Band 7	£22.50
Band 8a	£27.39
DOCTOR TIME (PER HOUR)	
FY1/FY2	£24.24
ST1-3	£30.79
APNP	£27.39
Registrar	£39.02
Consultant	£76.11
REFERRAL TO OTHER SPECIALTIES	
Surgery	£178.55
Medicine	£272.74
ENT	£146.92
Neuro	£411.78
INPATIENT ADMISSION	
Short stay (HRG PW20C, 3 days non-elective stay) #	£1,712
Excess bed day charge #	£462
Unit costs provided by Alder Hey Finance Team unless otherwise stated:	
# NHS Reference costs 2016	
* British National Formulary 2017	

753

754

755

756

757

758

759

760 Table 4: Descriptive statistics of study participants

761

	MEAN (SD)	MEDIAN (IQR)	MIN	MAX
Age	3.28 (3.09)	2.17 (3.5)	4 days	15.98 years
Gender Male (Freq)	53.5% (3,484)	-	-	-
Temperature	38.7 (1.07)	38.6 (1.7)	35	41.4
Respiratory rate (bpm)	29.95 (9.23)	28 (8)	14	188
Pulse (bpm)	138.7 (25.98)	138 (37)	22	250
MANCHESTER TRIAGE SCALE (MTS) CLASSIFICATION				
MTS Green (Freq)	47.52% (3,097)	-	-	-
MTS Yellow (Freq)	8.88% (579)	-	-	-
MTS Yellow/Red (Freq)	0.17% (11)	-	-	-
MTS Orange (Freq)	17.06% (1,112)	-	-	-
MTS Orange/Red (Freq)	23.03% (1,501)	-	-	-
MTS Red (Freq)	0.39% (27)	-	-	-
MTS Not recorded (Freq)	2.9% (191)	-	-	-
TIMINGS				
Time between booking and triage (mins)	15.3 (14.7)	11 (18)	0	71
	<i><10 mins</i>	47.8%		
	<i>11-20 mins</i>	24.1%		
	<i>21-40 mins</i>	20%		
	<i>41-60 mins</i>	5.6%		

	<i>>61 mins</i>	2.5%		
Time between triage and consultation (mins)	67.9 (52)	55 (65)	0	609
	<i><30 mins</i>	26.9%		
	<i>31-60 mins</i>	27.7%		
	<i>61-120 mins</i>	30.8%		
	<i>121-180 mins</i>	11.4%		
	<i>181-240 mins</i>	2.6%		
	<i>> 240 mins</i>	0.6%		
Time in ED post consultation (mins)	68.4 (70.6)	45 (72)	0	630
	<i><30 mins</i>	43.5%		
	<i>30-60 mins</i>	15.1%		
	<i>61-120 mins</i>	24.8%		
	<i>121-180 mins</i>	9.7%		
	<i>>181 mins</i>	7%		
Total time in ED (mins)	151.6 (81.3)	135 (98)	16	729
	<i><60 mins</i>	8.3%		
	<i>61-120 mins</i>	32.7%		
	<i>121-240 mins</i>	46.9%		
	<i>241-360 mins</i>	9.6%		
	<i>>361 mins</i>	2.5%		
Inpatient length of stay (Days)				

	<i>Not hospitalised</i>	93.51%			
	<i>1-3 days</i>	3.42%			
	<i>4-7 days</i>	2.43%			
	<i>8+ days</i>	0.63%			
Reattendance (Freq)		3.43% (224)	-	-	-
Afterhours (Freq)		88.9% (5,798)	-	-	-
Winter (Freq)		60.1% (3,918)	-	-	-
REVIEWING CLINICIAN					
APNP		2.73% (178)	-	-	-
Consultant		7.99% (521)	-	-	-
Foundation year 1&2		0.91% (59)	-	-	-
Registrar		22.05% (1,437)	-	-	-
ST1-3		66.32% (4,323)			

762

763

764

765

766

767

768

769

770

771

772

773 Table 5: Health service costs of paediatric febrile illness by sub-group

774

	Number	Mean	Std. dev	95% CI	Median	IQR	P-value*
All	6,518	£223.55	£719.65	£33.55-£1,275.85	£51.92	£22.35	-
Age							
0-3months	129	£1,000.28	£1,469.98	£82.39-£2,993.37	£76.65	£1,834.10	
3-6 months	281	£522.33	£1,737.66	£122.08-£2,123.51	£53.63	£55.70	
6-12 months	1,041	£205.28	£585.18	£28.26-£734.39	£51.29	£21.50	p=0.0001
1-3 years	2,498	£190.44	£594.95	£13.22-£643.89	£51.64	£21.60	
3-6 years	1,547	£158.97	£501.82	£20.43-£1,596.43	£51.29	£19.80	
6-10 years	707	£165.92	£485.04	£11.14-£843.02	£52.98	£20.70	
10-16 years	315	£408.32	£1,030.12	£44.97-£2,188.27	£55.55	£40.90	
Gender							
Male	3,482	£210.17	£600.23	£38.45-£818.68	£51.29	£21.50	p=0.0001
Female	3,036	£238.90	£835.77	£14.13-£924.63	£53.16	£23.10	
NICE NG51 heart rate red flag²⁷							
Yes	2,797	£259.40	£848.10	£21.76-£1,015.89	£54.03	£24.60	p=0.0001
No	3,721	£196.59	£604.38	£18.36-£699.74	£50.87	£20.30	
NICE NG51 respiratory rate red flag²⁷							
Yes	394	£493.92	£1,035.52	£89.16-£2,011.32	£66.67	£70.45	p=0.0001
No	6,124	£206.15	£691.06	£23.71-£737.44	£51.29	£21.50	

Clinical grade							
APNP	178	£109.52	£312.67	£12.74-£741.65	£48.01	£21.80	p=0.0001
Consultant	521	£315.13	£1,344.91	£25.76-£1,536.36	£73.23	£40.70	
FY 1&2	59	£731.78	£913.38	£97.91-£1,125.77	£327.98	£49.90	
Registrar	1,437	£255.40	£702.86	£19.40-£1,045.91	£54.49	£23.80	
ST1-3	4,323	£199.68	£615.00	£12.51-£721.02	£49.77	£28.05	
Afterhours							
Yes	5,798	£222.22	£726.36	£14.77-£776.64	£51.92	£22.40	p=0.0018
No	720	£234.19	£664.61	£11.96-£913.33	£51.65	£22.00	
MTS classification							
Green	3,098	£121.78	£390.33	£15.81-£	£49.43	£19.05	p=0.0001
Yellow	579	£424.43	£1,027.90	£340.69-£508.17	£63.10	£557.35	
Yellow/Red	10	£85.71	£95.24	£71.73-£99.42	£52.33	£16.50	
Orange	1,112	£487.16	£1,209.15	£416.08-£558.24	£68.86	£77.05	
Orange/Red	1,502	£152.13	£491.60	£123.44-£170.56	£51.84	£17.20	
Red	26	£549.42	£813.99	£236.47-£862.35	£76.88	£1,165.85	
Not recorded	191	£292.01	£966.43	£154.93-£429.09	£50.87	£20.40	
Final diagnosis							
Bacterial							
Infection/syndrome	460	£988.19	£1,781.97	£86.89-£2,971.08	£77.95	£1,757.35	
Viral							
Infection/syndrome	1,595	£294.52	£797.43	£18.92-£1,082.33	£51.64	£24.25	

Inflammatory							p=0.0001
infection/syndrome	74	£582.58	£1,302.26	£37.60-£1,516.05	£63.44	£1,140.65	
Other or trivial							
infection	130	£390.06	£786.27	£22.34-£1,243.30	£64.04	£187.15	
Unknown cause	4,259	£103.06	£286.52	£12.40-633.87	£51.29	£18.60	
<i>*Kruskal-Wallis test</i>							

775

776

777

778

779

780

781

782

783

784

785

786

787

788

789

790

791

792

793

794

795

796

797

798

799

800

801

802

803

804

805

806

807

808

809

CO-EFFICIENT	LN(β)	EXP (β)	95% CI (β) LOW	95% CI (β) HIGH	P-VALUE
0-3m	1.265	3.543	2.589	4.85	0.001
3-6m	0.791	2.207	1.544	3.155	0.001
6-12m	0.171	1.186	0.924	1.524	0.180
3-6Y	-0.164	0.848	0.705	1.021	0.082
6-10Y	-0.046	0.954	0.738	1.235	0.724
10-16Y	0.656	1.927	1.399	2.654	0.001
Gender (Male)	-0.163	0.849	0.736	0.978	0.024
Time from Book-in to Triage	-0.005	0.994	0.990	0.999	0.013
NICE HR	0.034	1.034	0.894	1.197	0.644
NICE RR	0.543	1.721	1.289	2.299	0.001
Time from Triage to Call in	-0.001	0.999	0.997	1.000	0.357
APNP	-0.555	0.573	0.374	0.878	0.011
FY1/FY2	1.161	3.193	2.017	5.055	0.001
ST1-3	-0.161	0.851	0.670	1.081	0.187
Registrar	-0.068	0.933	0.719	1.212	0.608
After Hours**	0.147	1.159	0.867	1.548	0.317
Winter	-0.215	0.806	0.695	0.934	0.004
MTS Yellow	0.868	2.382	1.905	2.979	0.001

MTS Orange	1.049	2.857	2.397	3.405	0.001
MTS Red	1.096	2.992	1.762	5.081	0.001

Figures are exponentiated GLM (gamma, log) coefficients, interpreted as x-fold increases versus the reference group.

* Reference group age =1-3 years, reference group clinical grade = consultants, reference group MTS classification = green

**Between the hours of 6.30pm and 8a.m Monday to Friday, and all-day Saturday, Sunday and bank holidays.

812

813

814

815

816

817

818

819

820

821

822

823

824

825

826

827

828

829

830

831 Table 10: Sensitivity analyses of determinants of healthcare costs for paediatric febrile episodes

832

	β (BASE-CASE) #	β (BOOTSTRAPPED)	MINIMUM β (% LOWER) #	MAXIMUM β (% HIGHER) #	STATISTICALLY SIGNIFICANT*
0-3 months	3.543	3.11	2.16 (39.02%)	3.92 (10.69%)	100%
0-6 months	2.207	2.08	1.45 (34.39%)	2.68 (21.55%)	100%
6-12 months	1.186	1.27	1.00 (15.75%)	1.54 (29.84%)	38.38%
3-6 years	0.848	0.88	0.68 (19.3%)	0.98 (15.77%)	19.19%
6-10 years	0.954	1.00	0.74 (22.39%)	1.18 (23.63%)	0%
10-16 years	1.927	1.81	1.25 (35.27%)	2.10 (8.98%)	100%
Gender (Male)	0.849	0.90	0.78 (7.91%)	0.99 (16.64%)	8.08%
Time (Book-in to Triage)	0.994	1.00	0.99 (0.24%)	1.00 (0.65%)	16.16%
NICE HR	1.034	1.03	0.89 (14.04%)	1.12 (8.75%)	0%
NICE RR	1.721	1.65	1.19 (30.71%)	1.99 (15.60%)	100%
Time (Triage to Call in)	0.999	1.00	1.00 (0.14%)	1.00 (0.13%)	3.03%
APNP	0.573	0.69	0.37 (36.23%)	0.99 (72.91%)	28.28%
FY1/FY2	3.193	3.29	1.98 (37.94%)	4.06 (27.11%)	100%
ST1-3	0.851	0.90	0.72 (15.88%)	1.01 (18.17%)	0%
REG	0.933	1.00	0.76 (19.02%)	1.12 (20.10%)	0%
After Hours	1.159	1.19	0.90 (21.98%)	1.47 (26.54%)	2.02%

Winter	0.806	0.79	0.68 (15.08%)	0.89 (10.11%)	98.99%
MTS Yellow	2.382	2.27	1.77 (25.67%)	2.61 (9.59%)	100%
MTS Orange	2.857	2.89	2.23 (22.08%)	3.21 (12.43%)	100%
MTS Red	2.992	4.52	1.95 (34.80%)	6.87 (129.76%)	100%
Constant	164.8	143.50	90.33 (45.19%)	179.37 (8.84%)	100%

Figures are exponentiated GLM (gamma, log) coefficients, interpreted as x-fold increases versus the reference group. Reference group age =1-3 years, reference group clinical grade = consultants, reference group MTS classification = green

*Proportion of 100 bootstrapped GLM regressions in which p-value was <0.05

833

834

835

836

837

838

839

840

841

842

843

844

845