Contents lists available at ScienceDirect



International Journal of Infectious Diseases



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/ijid

# In-hospital mortality risk stratification in children aged under 5 years with pneumonia with or without pulse oximetry: A secondary analysis of the Pneumonia REsearch Partnership to Assess WHO REcommendations (PREPARE) dataset



Shubhada Hooli<sup>a</sup>, Carina King<sup>b</sup>, Eric D. McCollum<sup>c</sup>, Tim Colbourn<sup>d</sup>, Norman Lufesi<sup>e</sup>, Charles Mwansambo<sup>e</sup>, Christopher J. Gregory<sup>f</sup>, Somsak Thamthitiwat<sup>g</sup>, Clare Cutland<sup>bj</sup>, Shabir Ahmed Madhi<sup>h</sup>, Marta C. Nunes<sup>h</sup>, Bradford D. Gessner<sup>i</sup>, Tabish Hazir<sup>j</sup>, Joseph L. Mathew<sup>k</sup>, Emmanuel Addo-Yobo<sup>1</sup>, Noel Chisaka<sup>m</sup>, Mumtaz Hassan<sup>n</sup>, Patricia L. Hibberd<sup>o</sup>, Prakash Jeena<sup>p</sup>, Juan M. Lozano<sup>q</sup>, William B. MacLeod<sup>o</sup>, Archana Patel<sup>1</sup>, Donald M. Thea<sup>0</sup>, Ngoc Tuong Vy Nguyen<sup>s</sup>, Syed MA. Zaman<sup>t</sup>, Raul O. Ruvinsky<sup>u</sup>, Marilla Lucero<sup>v</sup>, Cissy B. Kartasasmita<sup>w</sup>, Claudia Turner<sup>x</sup>, Rai Asghar<sup>y</sup>, Salem Banajeh<sup>z</sup>, Imran Igbal<sup>aa</sup>, Irene Maulen-Radovan<sup>ab</sup>, Greta Mino-Leon<sup>ac</sup>, Samir K. Saha<sup>ad</sup>, Mathuram Santosham<sup>ae</sup>, Sunit Singhi<sup>af</sup>, Shally Awasthi<sup>ag</sup>, Ashish Bavdekar<sup>ah</sup>, Monidarin Chou<sup>ai</sup>, Pagbajabyn Nymadawa<sup>aj</sup>, Jean-William Pape<sup>ak</sup>, Glaucia Paranhos-Baccala<sup>al</sup>, Valentina Sanchez Picot<sup>al</sup>, Mala Rakoto-Andrianarivelo<sup>am</sup>, Vanessa Rouzier<sup>an</sup>, Graciela Russomando<sup>ao</sup>, Mariam Sylla<sup>ap</sup>, Philippe Vanhems<sup>aq</sup>, Jianwei Wang<sup>ar</sup>, Sudha Basnet<sup>as</sup>, Tor A. Strand<sup>at</sup>, Mark I. Neuman<sup>au</sup>, Luis Martinez Arroyo<sup>av</sup>, Marcela Echavarria<sup>aw</sup>, Shinjini Bhatnagar<sup>ax</sup>, Nitya Wadhwa<sup>ax</sup>, Rakesh Lodha<sup>ay</sup>, Satinder Aneja<sup>az</sup>, Angela Gentile<sup>ba</sup>, Mandeep Chadha<sup>bb</sup>, Siddhivinayak Hirve<sup>bc</sup>, Kerry-Ann F. O'Grady<sup>bd</sup>, Alexey W. Clara<sup>be</sup>, Chris A. Rees<sup>bf</sup>, Harry Campbell<sup>bg</sup>, Harish Nair<sup>bg</sup>, Jennifer Falconer<sup>bg</sup>, Linda J. Williams<sup>bg</sup>, Margaret Horne<sup>bg</sup>, Shamim A. Qazi<sup>bh</sup>, Yasir Bin Nisar<sup>bi,\*</sup>, On behalf of the Pneumonia REsearch Partnership to Assess WHO REcommendations (PREPARE) study group

<sup>a</sup> Division of Pediatric Emergency Medicine, Texas Children's Hospital/Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, United States of America <sup>b</sup> Department of Global Public Health, Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden and Institute for Global Health, University College London, London, United Kingdom

<sup>e</sup> Ministry of Health, Lilongwe, Malawi

- <sup>g</sup> Division of Global Health Protection, Thailand Ministry of Public Health–US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention Collaboration, Nonthaburi, Thailand <sup>h</sup> South African Medical Research Council: Vaccines and Infectious Diseases Analytics Research Unit, School of Pathology, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa; Department of Science and Technology/National Research Foundation: Vaccine Preventable
- Diseases Unit, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa

<sup>i</sup> Pfizer Vaccines, Collegeville, United States of America

<sup>j</sup> The Children's Hospital, (Retired), Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS), Islamabad, Pakistan (deceased)

<sup>k</sup> Advanced Pediatrics Centre, Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research, Chandigarh, India

<sup>1</sup>Kwame Nkrumah University of Science & Technology/Komfo Anokye Teaching Hospital, Kumasi, Ghana

<sup>m</sup> World Bank, Washington DC, United States of America

<sup>n</sup> The Children's Hospital, Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS), Islamabad, Pakistan (deceased)

<sup>o</sup> Department of Global Health, Boston University School of Public Health, Boston, United States of America

\* Corresponding author: Tel: +41-22-791-5595; Fax: +41-22-791-4853 *E-mail address:* nisary@who.int (Y.B. Nisar).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2023.02.005

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>c</sup> Global Program in Respiratory Sciences, Eudowood Division of Pediatric Respiratory Sciences, Department of Pediatrics, Johns Hopkins School of Medicine, Baltimore, United States of America and Department of International Health, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, United States of America

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>d</sup> Institute for Global Health, University College London, London, United Kingdom

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>f</sup> Division of Vector-Borne Diseases, US Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Fort Collins, United States of America

<sup>1201-9712/© 2023</sup> The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd on behalf of International Society for Infectious Diseases. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

<sup>p</sup> University of KwaZulu-Natal, Durban, South Africa

<sup>9</sup> Florida International University, Miami, United States of America

- <sup>r</sup> Lata Medical Research Foundation, Nagpur and Datta Meghe Institute of Medical Sciences, Sawangi, India
- <sup>s</sup> Children Hospital No 1, Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam
- <sup>t</sup> Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, Liverpool, United Kingdom
- <sup>u</sup> Dirección de Control de Enfermedades Inmunoprevenibles, Ministerio de Salud de la Nación, Buenos Aires, Argentina
- <sup>v</sup> Research Institute for Tropical Medicine, Manila, Philippines
- Department of Child Health, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia
- \* Shoklo Malaria Research Unit, Mae Sot, Thailand
- <sup>y</sup> Rawalpindi Medical College, Rawalpindi, Pakistan
- <sup>2</sup> Sana'a University, Sana'a, Yemen
- aa Combined Military Hospital Institute of Medical Sciences, Multan, Pakistan
- <sup>ab</sup> Instituto Nacional de Pediatria Division de Investigacion Insurgentes, Mexico City, Mexico
- <sup>ac</sup> Children's Hospital Dr Francisco de Ycaza Bustamante, Head of Department, Infectious diseases, Guayaquil, Ecuador
- <sup>ad</sup> Child Health Research Foundation and Dhaka Shishu Hospital, Dhaka, Bangladesh
- ae International Vaccine Access Center (IVAC), Department of International Health, Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, United States of America
- <sup>af</sup> Medanta, The Medicity, Gurgaon, India
- <sup>ag</sup> King George's Medical University, Department of Pediatrics, Lucknow, India
- <sup>ah</sup> KEM Hospital Pune, Department of Pediatrics, Pune, India
- ai University of Health Sciences, Rodolph Mérieux Laboratory & Ministry of Environment, Phom Phen, Cambodia
- <sup>aj</sup> Mongolian Academy of Sciences, Academy of Medical Sciences, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
- <sup>ak</sup> GHESKIO, Centre GHESKIO, Port au Prince, Haiti
- <sup>al</sup> Fondation Merieux, Lyon, France
- <sup>am</sup> Centre d'Infectiologie Charles Mérieux, Antananarivo, Madagascar
- an GHESKIO, Department of Pediatrics, Port au Prince, Haiti

<sup>ao</sup> Universidad Nacional de Asuncion, Departamento de Biología Molecular y Genética, Instituto de Investigaciones en Ciencias de la Salud, Asuncion, Paraguay

- <sup>ap</sup> Gabriel Touré Hospital, Department of Pediatrics, Bamako, Mali
- <sup>aq</sup> Unité d'Hygiène, Epidémiologie, Infectiovigilance et Prévention, Hospices Civils de Lyon, Lyon, France and Centre International de Recherche en
- Infectiologie, Institut National de la Santé et de la Recherche Médicale U1111, CNRS Unité Mixte de Recherche 5308, École Nationale Supérieure de Lyon, Université Claude Bernard Lvon 1. Lvon. France
- ar Chinese Academy of Medical Sciences & Peking Union, Medical College Institute of Pathogen Biology, MOH Key Laboratory of Systems Biology of Pathogens and Dr Christophe Mérieux Laboratory, Beijing, China
- as Center for Intervention Science in Maternal and Child Health, University of Bergen, Norway and Department of Pediatrics, Tribhuvan University Institute of Medicine. Nepal
- <sup>au</sup> Division of Emergency Medicine, Boston Children's Hospital, Harvard Medical School, Boston, United States of America
- av PNUD/National University, Montevideo, Uruguay
- aw Clinical Virology Unit, Centro de Educación Médica e Investigaciones Clínicas, Mar del Plata, Argentina
- ax Translational Health Science and Technology Institute, Faridabad, India
- ay All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi, India
- az School of Medical Sciences & Research, Sharda University, Greater Noida, India
- ba Department of Epidemiology, "R. Gutiérrez" Children's Hospital, Buenos Aires, Argentina
- bb Former Scientist G, ICMR National Institute of Virology, Pune, India
- bc KEM Hospital Research Center, Pune, India
- <sup>bd</sup> Australian Centre for Health Services Innovation, Queensland University of Technology, Kelvin Grove, Australia
- <sup>be</sup> Centers for Disease Control, Central American Region, Guatemala City, Guatemala
- bf Division of Pediatric Emergency Medicine, Emory University School of Medicine, Children's Healthcare of Atlanta, Atlanta, United States of America
- <sup>bg</sup> Centre for Global Health, Usher Institute, The University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, Scotland
- <sup>bh</sup> Department of Maternal, Newborn, Child, and Adolescent Health (Retired), World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- bi Department of Maternal, Newborn, Child, and Adolescent Health and Ageing, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- <sup>bj</sup> African Leadership in Vaccinology Expertise (Alive), Faculty of Health Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa

#### ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 8 September 2022 Revised 1 February 2023 Accepted 5 February 2023

Keywords: Pneumonia Child Danger sign Chest indrawing Under 5 Pulse oximetry

## ABSTRACT

Objectives: We determined the pulse oximetry benefit in pediatric pneumonia mortality risk stratification and chest-indrawing pneumonia in-hospital mortality risk factors.

Methods: We report the characteristics and in-hospital pneumonia-related mortality of children aged 2-59 months who were included in the Pneumonia Research Partnership to Assess WHO Recommendations dataset. We developed multivariable logistic regression models of chest-indrawing pneumonia to identify mortality risk factors.

Results: Among 285,839 children, 164,244 (57.5%) from hospital-based studies were included. Pneumonia case fatality risk (CFR) without pulse oximetry measurement was higher than with measurement (5.8%, 95% confidence interval [CI] 5.6-5.9% vs 2.1%, 95% CI 1.9-2.4%). One in five children with chest-indrawing pneumonia was hypoxemic (19.7%, 95% CI 19.0-20.4%), and the hypoxemic CFR was 10.3% (95% CI 9.1-11.5%). Other mortality risk factors were younger age (either 2-5 months [adjusted odds ratio (aOR) 9.94, 95% CI 6.67-14.84] or 6-11 months [aOR 2.67, 95% CI 1.71-4.16]), moderate malnutrition (aOR 2.41, 95% CI 1.87-3.09), and female sex (aOR 1.82, 95% CI 1.43-2.32).

Conclusion: Children with a pulse oximetry measurement had a lower CFR. Many children hospitalized with chest-indrawing pneumonia were hypoxemic and one in 10 died. Young age and moderate malnutrition were risk factors for in-hospital chest-indrawing pneumonia-related mortality. Pulse oximetry should be integrated in pneumonia hospital care for children under 5 years.

© 2023 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Ltd on behalf of International Society for Infectious Diseases. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

at Research Department, Innlandet Hospital Trust, Lillehammer, Norway

#### Background

Pneumonia and other acute lower respiratory infections (ALRIs) remain the leading cause of death in children aged 1-59 months [1]. Over the last 2 decades, substantial progress has been made to reduce mortality and limit unnecessary hospitalizations. Randomized controlled trials demonstrated that children aged 2-59 months with chest-indrawing pneumonia without any general danger sign experience similar treatment failure rates with oral amoxicillin as those managed with injectable penicillin [2-4]. In response to these findings, in 2012 the World Health Organization (WHO) revised their pneumonia management guideline [5], which was included in the second edition of the WHO Pocket book of hospital care for children [6] and the Integrated Management of Childhood Illness chart booklet [7] in 2014 (Box 1) [6,8]. It recommends that children aged 2-59 months without HIV with chest indrawing but without general danger signs (unable to drink/feed; convulsions; sleepy/lethargic; vomiting everything; severe wheezing; and signs of respiratory distress, including grunting, head nodding, nasal flaring), stridor, severe malnutrition, or hypoxemia (defined as a peripheral transcutaneous oxyhemoglobin saturation [SpO<sub>2</sub>] <90%) can be treated with oral amoxicillin. Other trials in India [9], Malawi [10], Kenya [11], and Pakistan [12,13] and two observational studies in Papua New Guinea [14] and Kenya [15] demonstrated that these children could be safely treated with oral antibiotics at home. However, most studies screened for and excluded hypoxemic children, using definitions ranging from SpO<sub>2</sub> <90% to <85%. In addition, none were powered to demonstrate the differences in mortality [4].

**Box 1**. 2005 versus 2013 WHO pneumonia hospitalization criteria for those aged 2-59 months.

Pneumonia classification	WHO pocketbook 2005	WHO pocketbook 2013				
Non-severe (outpatient treatment)	Fast breathing <sup>a</sup>	Fast breathing <sup>a</sup> and/or chest indrawing				
Severe (hospitalize)	Chest indrawing	General danger sign <sup>b</sup> or oxygen saturation $<$ 90%				
Very severe (hospitalize)	General danger signs <sup>b</sup>	Not applicable				
<ul> <li><sup>a</sup> Fast breathing for age: RR ≥50 bpm in those aged 2-11 months and RR</li> <li>≥40 bpm in those aged 12-59 month;</li> <li><sup>b</sup> Danger signs are either according to WHO pocketbook (i.e., central curposic appear graving pace) foring severe wheering head nod-</li> </ul>						

cyanosis, apnea, gasping, grunting, nasal flaring, severe wheezing, head nodding) or according to IMCI general danger sign (inability to drink, lethargy or unconscious, convulsions, vomit everything), stridor in a calm child or weight-for-age z-score <-3. bpm, breaths per minute; RR, respiration rate WHO, World Health Organization.

Chest indrawing is a cardinal feature of respiratory distress that precedes hypoxemia and respiratory failure in children. This inward movement of abdominal and chest wall soft tissue below the rib cage is due to the increased negative intrapleural pressures generated to expand lungs with poor compliance during inspiration [16]. Hypoxemia occurs most commonly when there is ventilation perfusion mismatch in the lungs from an ALRI and is most frequently measured noninvasively by a pulse oximeter device [17]. However, before COVID-19, when the data for the current analysis were collected, pulse oximetry was limited in many low-resource settings, particularly in primary and community care [18,19]. It is recognized that in the absence of pulse oximetry, the WHO Integrated Management of Childhood Illness protocol may miss hypoxemia, leading to misclassification of patients who need oxygen and inpatient care [20–25]. A retrospective Kenyan study conducted in district hospitals without pulse oximeters found that, apart from danger signs, mild to moderate pallor, age <12 months, lower chest indrawing, respiratory rate of 70 breaths or more, admission to a hospital in a malaria-endemic region, and moderate malnutrition were independently associated with pneumonia-related mortality [26].

The overall goal of this study was to understand the value of pulse oximetry in evaluating hospitalized children with pneumonia. We also explored additional clinical characteristics that were risk factors for chest-indrawing pneumonia mortality and could therefore be used to identify children with a high mortality risk. Using the WHO Pneumonia Research Partnership to Assess WHO Recommendations (PREPARE) study dataset, we aimed to (i) describe and compare the clinical characteristics and case fatality risk (CFR) by pneumonia severity among children with and without a pulse oximetry reading at study enrollment and (ii) determine inhospital mortality risk factors among children aged 2-59 months with chest-indrawing pneumonia, with and without pulse oximetry measurements.

#### Methods

# Study sample

We conducted a secondary analysis of collated datasets from 41 studies included in the WHO PREPARE project. These studies were conducted in 31 countries, including 29 low-middle-income countries (LMICs). Figure 1 describes how the analytic dataset was selected and used for this analysis. A detailed description of the studies is shown in Table 1 [2,3,27–48]. The primary data collection occurred between 1994 and 2014, and countries were at varying stages of Pneumococcus and *Haemophilus influenzae* type B (Hib) vaccine implementation.

#### Inclusion and exclusion criteria

The patient records of hospitalized children aged 2-59 months with WHO-defined pneumonia and had survival outcome were included in the current analyses. We excluded patient records from community-based studies, those without WHO signs for pneumonia classification, or those who had no survival outcomes (Figure 1). Children received hospital-based care, including antibiotics and supplemental oxygen when indicated and available according to local norms.

#### Definitions and variables

The WHO pneumonia severity was defined as fast breathing (respiratory rate above the age-specific cut-off), chest indrawing, or danger sign (Box 1). Before the 2012 WHO guidance revision [5], it was recommended that all children with chest indrawing, even those without danger signs, should be hospitalized for injectable antibiotics and supportive care. Variables were chosen *a priori* due to clinical significance and potential association with mortality based on previous studies. These variables include: age, sex, weight, weight-for-age z-score, temperature (normothermia [35.5-37.9°C], fever [ $\geq$ 38°C], and hypothermia [<35.5°C]), age-adjusted tachypnea, severe tachypnea (defined as respiratory rate  $\geq$ 70 breaths per minute), signs of severe respiratory distress (*i.e.*, grunting, head nodding, or nasal flaring), and SpO<sub>2</sub> (if reported) [6,7,20]. Although pallor and residence in malaria hyperendemic

# Table 1

Characteristics of hospital-based studies included in the analysis (n = 164,244).

First author	Study design	Years of study	Country(ies) of study	Year of introdu	ction	N	SpO <sub>2</sub> 93-100%, n (%)	SpO <sub>2</sub> 90-92%, n (%)	SpO <sub>2</sub> <90%, n (%)	No SpO <sub>2</sub> value, n (%)	Chest indrawing, n (%)	Deaths, n (%)
				PCV	HiB	-						
Addo-Yobo	Randomized controlled trial	1998-2000	Colombia Ghana India Mexico Pakistan South Africa Vietnam Zambia	2011 2012 No 2009 2014 2009 No 2013	1998 2002 2015 1999 2009 1999 2010 2004	1628	1041 (63.9%)	323 (19.8%)	240 (14.7%)	24 (1.5%)	1534 (94.2%)	15 (0.9%)
Ugpo Basnet Mathew Clara Marcone Benet	Prospective observational Randomized controlled trial Prospective cohort Retrospective cohort Prospective, cross-sectional Prospective, case-control study	1994-2000 2006-2008 2011-2013 2011-2013 2008-2010 2010-2014	Philippines Nepal India Panama Argentina Cambodia China Haiti India Madagascar Mali Paraguay	2020 2015 No 2010 2012 2015 No 2018 No 2012 2011 2012	2012 2009 2015 2000 1997 2010 No 2012 2015 2008 2007 2002	1097 638 1833 46 497 833	678 (61.8%) 68 (10.7%) 1192 (65.0%) 34 (73.9%) 41 (8.2%) 519 (62.3%)	227 (20.7%) 146 (22.9%) 283 (15.4%) 1 (2.2%) 76 (15.3%) 150 (18.0%)	190 (17.3%) 423 (66.3%) 341 (18.6%) 9 (19.6%) 32 (6.4%) 79 (9.5%)	2 (0.2%) 1 (0.2%) 17 (0.9%) 2 (4.3%) 348 (70.0%) 85 (10.2%)	436 (39.7%) 192 (30.1%) 0 (0.0%) 11 (23.9%) 0 (0.0%) 215 (25.8%)	$\begin{array}{c} 19 \ (1.7\%) \\ 6 \ (0.9\%) \\ 148 \ (8.2\%) \\ 1 \ (2.4\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 19 \ (2.3\%) \end{array}$
McCollum Lazzerini Gentile Gessner Lu	Prospective cohort Prospective cohort Retrospective observational Retrospective cohort Retrospective cross-sectional with follow-up	2012-2014 2001-2012 2001-2013 1999-2001 2005-2010	Malawi Malawi Argentina Indonesia Thailand	2011 2011 2012 No No	2002 2002 1997 2014 2019	14,032 101,182 305 5244 18,942	9629 (68.6%) 0 (0.0%) 64 (21.0%) 2177 (41.5%) 6664 (35.2%)	1190 (8.5%) 0 (0.0%) 111 (36.4%) 1238 (23.6%) 977 (5.2%)	1352 (9.6%) 0 (0.0%) 115 (37.7%) 1780 (33.9%) 791 (4.2%)	1861 (13.3%) 101,182 (100.0%) 15 (4.9%) 49 (0.9%) 10,510 (55.5%)	2658 (18.9%) 46,160 (45.6%) 0 (0.0%) 4174 (79.6%) 3777 (19.9%)	439 (3.1%) 6027 (6.0%) 3 (1.0%) 483 (9.2%) 106 (0.6%)
Hazir Hirve Hortal Wulandari Klugman Neuman O'Grady Ferrero Asghar	Randomized controlled trial Prospective observational Prospective observational Retrospective cohort Randomized controlled trial Prospective cohort Randomized controlled trial Prospective observational Randomized controlled trial	2005-2007 2009-2011 2009-2012 2012-2016 1998-2000 2006-2009 2001-2002 1998-2002 2000-2004	Pakistan India Uruguay Indonesia South Africa USA Australia Argentina Bangladesh Ecuador India Mexico Pakistan Yemen Zambia	2014 No 2008 No 2009 2000 2011 2012 2015 2010 No 2009 2014 2011 2013	2009 2015 1994 2014 1999 1985 1995 1997 2009 2003 2015 1999 2005 2005 2004	2067 249 553 1089 8113 576 90 1,357 894	0 (0.0%) 0 (0.0%) 413 (74.7%) 276 (25.3%) 4557 (56.2%) 501 (87.0%) 76 (84.4%) 0 (0.0%) 180 (20.1%)	$\begin{array}{c} 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 79 \ (14.3\%) \\ 200 \ (18.4\%) \\ 1813 \ (22.4\%) \\ 41 \ (7.1\%) \\ 6 \ (6.7\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 131 \ (14.6\%) \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 56 \ (10.1\%) \\ 330 \ (30.3\%) \\ 1581 \ (19.5\%) \\ 19 \ (3.3\%) \\ 1 \ (1.1\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 577 \ (64.5\%) \end{array}$	2067 (100%) 249 (100%) 5 (0.9%) 283 (26.0%) 162 (2.0%) 15 (2.6%) 7 (7.8%) 1357 (100%) 6 (0.7%)	1916 (92.7%) 0 (0.0%) 401 (72.5%) 249 (22.9%) 675 (8.3%) 0 (0.0%) 17 (18.9%) 1233 (90.9%) 0 (0.0%)	$\begin{array}{c} 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 6 \ (1.1\%) \\ 61 \ (5.6\%) \\ 418 \ (5.1\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 0 \ (0.0\%) \\ 21 \ (1.5\%) \\ 46 \ (5.1\%) \end{array}$
Turner Wadhwa Cutts	Prospective observational Randomized controlled trial Randomized controlled trial	2007-2008 2007-2010 2002-2004	Thailand India Gambia	No No 2009	2019 2015 1997	952 438 1589	602 (63.2%) 350 (79.9%) 1179 (74.2%)	183 (19.2%) 66 (15.1%) 113 (7.1%)	37 (3.9%) 17 (3.9%) 110 (6.9%)	130 (13.7%) 5 (1.1%) 187 (11.8%)	276 (29.0%) 256 (58.4%) 76 (4.8%)	0 (0.0%) 7 (1.6%) 96 (6.0%)

PCV: Pneumoccocus conjugate vaccine, HiB: Haemophilus influenzae type B, SpO<sub>2</sub>: oxygen saturation



**Figure 1.** WHO signs: Fast breathing (respiratory rate 50 or more per minute in 2-11 months old and 40 or more per minute in 12-59 months old), lower chest indrawing, or danger signs (defined below)†Of 26 hospital-based studies in the PREPARE dataset, 17 studies reported information on the presence of chest indrawing in children 2-59 months of age.‡Danger signs are either according to WHO pocketbook (i.e., central cyanosis, apnea, gasping, grunting, nasal flaring, severe wheezing, head nodding) or according to IMCI general danger sign (inability to drink, lethargy or unconscious, convulsions, vomit everything), stridor in a calm child or weight-for-age z-score <-3. SpO<sub>2</sub>: oxygen saturation; WHO, World Health Organization.

regions have been previously described as pneumonia-related mortality risk factors [26], these data were not routinely included in our dataset. Some of the studies that contributed to the dataset were multicountry and included malaria hyperendemic regions and nonhyperendemic regions, but the dataset identifies cases by study and does not include if the case was from a specific country. Our primary outcome of interest was in-hospital pneumoniarelated mortality.

#### Statistical analysis

To address the first objective, we described and compared the frequency, proportion with 95% confidence interval (CI), mean, median, and missingness of data on the clinical characteristics at the time of admission by pneumonia severity and if pulse oximetry was measured. Then, we reported the CFR by WHO pneumonia severity and compared these CFRs by the presence of pulse oximetry measurements. Pulse oximetry was categorized into no SpO<sub>2</sub> measurement and any SpO<sub>2</sub> measured at presentation. The measured group was further stratified into SpO<sub>2</sub> <90%, 90-92%, and 93-100% to explore the impact of these categories on CFR [49,50].

For the second objective, we exclusively used the data from the chest-indrawing pneumonia cases subset to fit two mixedeffects logistic regression models to explore the associations between demographic characteristics, nutritional status, and clinical signs at initial presentation with mortality. Mixed-effects modeling was chosen because some parameters had clear fixed effects on the outcome (tachypnea vs no tachypnea), whereas we assumed other parameters had a variable or unknown effect on the outcome (male vs female). In addition, we included variables to reflect the study type (observational vs randomized controlled trial) and pneumococcal vaccine (PCV) implementation at time of data collection because these factors had clear effects on mortality. Heterogeneity was accounted for at each study level. The first model included chest-indrawing cases with pulse oximetry measurements at hospitalization, and the second included those without pulse oximetry measurements. In the model that included pulse oximetry,  $SpO_2$  categories (<90%, 90-92%, and >93%) were treated as ordinal co-variables. To assess for bias, we described the variable missingness. We then conducted a bivariate analysis with complete cases. Variables with >15% missingness were excluded from the

multivariable model. We reported the adjusted odds ratio (aOR) with 95% CI.

## Results

## Included studies

Among the 285,839 children from 41 studies in the PREPARE dataset, 164,244 (57.5%) from 26 of the 41 included studies (conducted in 29 countries) met the inclusion criteria for analysis (Figure 1 and Table 1). All cases that met the inclusion criteria were enrolled in-hospital-based studies. Pulse oximetry measurements were reported in 27.8% (n = 45,675) of cases. Among the 164,244 children included in the analyses, there were 7921 deaths (CFR 4.8%). Of included cases, 12.6% (n = 20,672) had only fastbreathing pneumonia, 39.1% (n = 64,256) had chest indrawing with or without fast breathing, and 48.3% (n = 79,316) had any danger sign at the time of admission.

The majority of cases with a pulse oximetry measurement (62.5%, 28,554/45,675) were from three studies conducted in Malawi [33] (26.6%, n = 12,171), Thailand [37] (18.5%, n = 8432), and South Africa [41] (17.4%, n = 7951) (Table 1). For chest-indrawing pneumonia cases with pulse oximetry measurements (n = 12936), 20.5% were from Malawi [33] and 32.3% were from Indonesia [36].

A countrywide pneumonia surveillance study conducted in Malawi from 2001 to 2012 provided 85.3% (n = 101,182/118,569) of cases without pulse oximetry measurement [34]. This study contributed 90.0% (n = 46,160/51,320) of the cases with chest-indrawing pneumonia without pulse oximetry measurement. Four studies with overall CFRs  $\geq$ 6.0% were from India [29] (n = 1833, CFR 8.2%), Indonesia [36] (n = 5244, CFR 9.2%), the Gambia [48] (n = 1589, CFR 6.0%), and Malawi [34] (n = 101,182, CFR 6.0%).

#### Clinical characteristics

The overall hypoxemia (SpO<sub>2</sub> <90%) prevalence was 17.7% (95% CI 17.3-18.0%). A nearly similar prevalence of hypoxemia was observed in patients with chest-indrawing pneumonia (19.7%; 95% CI 19.0-20.4%) and patients with danger sign pneumonia (20.7%; 95% CI 20.2-21.2%). Of the 164,244 cases in the dataset, 6.1% reported data on signs of severe respiratory distress. Children with chest-

indrawing pneumonia with and without pulse oximetry measurements had similar characteristics except for differences in the prevalence of temperature  $\geq$ 38°C (35.9% with vs 40.5% without SpO<sub>2</sub>) and severe tachypnea (10.7% with vs 13.9% without SpO<sub>2</sub>), which might reflect the differences in frequency of missing data among cases without an SpO<sub>2</sub> measurement (Table 2). Among fast-breathing pneumonia cases, a larger proportion of children with *versus* without pulse oximetry measurements were aged 2-5 months (14.1% with vs 9.7% without SpO<sub>2</sub>). Otherwise, the demographic and clinical characteristics by pneumonia severity were similar between the SpO<sub>2</sub> measured and not measured cohorts.

# Case fatality risk

In Table 3, we compare the CFR of cases with and without pulse oximetry integrated into their care. Column 1 reflects the data from four studies with 100% missing SpO<sub>2</sub> values. Pulse oximetry was not documented in these studies because it was not integrated into the overall study design. Column 2 reflects the data from studies with <100% missing values. Except for two retrospective studies by Lu (55.5%) and Wulandari (26.0%), all studies had <15% missing SpO<sub>2</sub> values. We chose to include the Lu and Wulandari studies in column 2 because the subanalyses suggested that pulse oximetry measurements were missing at random because there was no difference in the CFR among children with and without a documented SpO<sub>2</sub> measurement. Most missing measurements were in children with fast-breathing pneumonia, and pulse oximetry is routinely not used in these cases.

The CFR of patients without pulse oximetry measurement integrated as part of their care was significantly higher than those with a recorded measurement (5.8% vs 2.1%) (Table 3). This was particularly notable in children with any danger sign because those without a pulse oximetry measurement had a CFR of 8.5% (95% CI 8.2-8.7%) versus 4.6% (95% CI 4.3-4.9%) among those with a measurement. In patients with SpO<sub>2</sub> measurement, independent of hypoxemia, the overall CFR of chest-indrawing pneumonia was 3.5% (95% CI 3.2-3.8%) versus 4.6% (95% CI 4.3-4.9%) in danger sign cases. Hypoxemic pneumonia cases of SpO<sub>2</sub> <90% with a danger sign or chest indrawing had high CFRs of 11.8% and 10.3%, respectively. The CFR of patients with chest indrawing with SpO<sub>2</sub> <90% (10.3%, 9.1-11.5%) was four times higher than those with an SpO<sub>2</sub> of 90-92% (2.6%; 95% CI 2.0-3.3%) and six times higher than those with an SpO<sub>2</sub> of 93-100% (1.6%; 95% CI 1.3-1.9%) (Table 3).

## Mortality risk factors among chest-indrawing cases

We report the models of risks for chest-indrawing pneumoniaassociated mortality with (Table 4) and without (Supplementary Tables 1 and 2) pulse oximetry measurements. Of cases with a measured SpO<sub>2</sub> age bands 2-5 months (aOR 9.94, 95% CI 6.67-14.84) and 6-11 months (aOR 2.01, 95% CI 1.27-3.18), SpO<sub>2</sub> <90% (aOR 3.47, 95% CI 2.66-4.52), -3 <weight-for-age z-score <-2 (aOR 2.67, 95% CI 1.71-4.16), and female sex (aOR 1.82, 95% CI 1.43-2.32) were associated with in-hospital mortality (Table 4). Notably, 41.8% (95% CI 37.2-46.5%; 188/450) of deaths occurred in children with an SpO<sub>2</sub> >90%. Children with chest-indrawing pneumonia without a pulse oximetry measurement had similar pneumonia-related mortality risk factors (Supplementary Table 1). Because 90.0% of these cases came from Malawi, we conducted a sensitivity analysis by excluding Malawi cases and found that only moderate malnutrition remained a mortality risk factor (Supplementary Table 2).

#### Discussion

In this study, the CFR of cases with an SpO<sub>2</sub> measurement was lower than those without. Hypoxemia of SpO<sub>2</sub> <90% was

highly prevalent among children with chest-indrawing or danger sign pneumonia. Patients with chest-indrawing and danger sign pneumonia with an SpO<sub>2</sub> <90% had a CFR of 10.3% and 11.8%, respectively. Age bands 2-5 months and 6-11 months, SpO<sub>2</sub> <90%, moderate malnutrition, and female sex were independently associated with chest-indrawing pneumonia-related in-hospital death. We used a large multicountry dataset of hospitalized patients with pneumonia to explore the clinical outcomes in child pneumonia cases with and without SpO2 measurement and focused on cases with chest-indrawing pneumonia. Given the size of the dataset, our post hoc power estimate was greater than 95%. All data-contributing studies were conducted before the implementation of the 2012 WHO pneumonia management guidance recommending that children with chest-indrawing pneumonia without danger signs or hypoxemia (if pulse oximetry is available) could be safely managed in outpatient settings with oral amoxicillin [5].

The CFR was higher among child pneumonia cases without a documented SpO<sub>2</sub> measurement. The reduced CFR with pulse oximeter use may reflect the impact of pulse oximetry on hospital outcomes or effects of a more functional health system [51]. Healthcare worker identification of hypoxemia likely influenced if a child received supplemental oxygen [52,53]. In contrast, clinicians may use pulse oximetry as an objective measurement to improve their assessments, which, in some cases, may result in the de-escalation of unnecessary care, presumably freeing up resources for children who could benefit from them [54]. Pulse oximetry implementation has been shown to increase the diagnosis of pneumonia [55], improve the overall quality of care for pneumonia and malaria [19,56], and decrease hospital-based pediatric ALRI mortality, independent of supplemental oxygen availability [57].

Our hypoxemia prevalence and some of our CFR findings differ from other published reports. Our estimates are slightly higher than that of a 2009 metanalysis [58]. This study included a small amount of data (<10%) from studies that enrolled children aged up to 12 years. Hypoxemic pneumonia is less frequent in older children, which may explain their slightly lower estimates. In contrast, our findings are much lower than that reported by two meta-analyses [59,60] and the Pneumonia Etiology Research for Child Health (PERCH) study [61] (47-35.8%). Misclassification bias could explain these differences. In the PERCH study, at most study sites, hypoxemia was defined as an SpO<sub>2</sub> <92%. In Rahman et al.'s metanalysis, they were unable to disaggregate data, and 17 of the 57 included studies defined hypoxemia as an SpO<sub>2</sub> <92-95% [60]. All four studies presented combined chest-indrawing and danger sign cases into one cohort when describing hypoxemia frequency. In previous works [49,50,62] conducted in countries with a high anemia prevalence [63], an SpO<sub>2</sub> of 90-92% was proposed as an ALRI-associated mortality risk factor, independent of clinical severity, but this was not associated with chestindrawing pneumonia mortality in our data. In our study, hypoxemia (SpO<sub>2</sub> <90%) prevalence was high and it put children, particularly those with chest indrawing or danger signs, at risk for death. Despite the WHO's recommendation to use pulse oximetry to assess hypoxemia and clear evidence that pulse oximeters are essential medical devices, many outpatient facilities and hospitals in LMICs do not have or do not use pulse oximeters in routine care [18,19,64-67]. Unfortunately, clinical signs alone are not reliable predictors of hypoxemia, resulting in both falsepositive and false-negative classifications, leading to many hypoxemic children not receiving oxygen and potentially contributing to pneumonia-related deaths [20,53,68]. Global uptake of pulse oximeters at the health system level will take time due to funding and implementation challenges, such as procurement, training, promotion of use, and ongoing monitoring and feedback [19,69]. Nonetheless, pulse oximetry implementation is a necessary investment.

#### Table 2

Baseline characteristics of hospitalized children aged 2-59 months with pneumonia by pneumonia classification and pulse oximetry assessment (N = 164,244).

	Fast breathing $(n = 20,672)$	)	Chest indrawing $(n = 64,25)$	6)	Danger signs <sup>a</sup> $(n = 79,316)$		
Baseline characteristics	Pulse oximetry not measured $(n = 11,124)$	Pulse oximetry measured $(n = 9548)$	Pulse oximetry not measured ( $n = 51,320$ )	Pulse oximetry measured $(n = 12,936)$	Pulse oximetry not measured ( $n = 56,125$ )	Pulse oximetry measured $(n = 23,191)$	
Study design							
Clinical trial	56 (0.5, 0.4, 0.6)	1259 (13.2, 12.5, 13.9)	1949 (3.8, 3.6, 4.0) 49,371	2717 (21.0, 20.3, 21.7)	454 (0.8, 0.7, 0.9)	9022 (8.9, 38.3, 39.5)	
Observational study	11,068 (99.5, 99.3, 99.6)	8289 (86.8, 86.1, 87.5)	(96.2, 96.0, 96.4)	10,219 (79.0, 78.3, 79.7)	55,671 (99.2, 99.1, 99.3)	14,169 (61.1, 60.5, 61.7)	
Pneumococcal vaccine rollout							
Yes	29 (0.3, 0.2, 0.4)	903 (9.5, 8.9, 10.1)	546 (1.1, 1.0, 1.2)	2524 (19.5, 18.8, 20.2)	1293 (2.3, 2.2, 2.4)	9336 (40.3, 39.6, 40.9)	
No	11,095 (99.7, 99.6, 99.8)	8645 (90.5, 89.9, 91.1)	50,774 (98.9, 98.8, 99.0)	10,412 (80.5, 79.8, 81.2)	54,832 (97.7, 97.6, 97.8)	13,855 (59.7, 59.1, 60.4)	
Age in months							
median value, (IQR)	18.4 (12.2, 28.1)	17.6 (10.5, 27.1)	10.0 (5.0, 17.9)	9.5 (5.0, 17.8)	10.0 (5.0, 19.0)	10.1 (5.0, 18.9)	
Age category	1084 (9.7, 9.2-10.3)	1345 (14.1, 13.4- 14.8)	17,636 (33.3, 32.9-33.7)	4117 (31.8, 31.0-32.6)	18,509 (33.0, 32.6-33.4)	7088 (30.6, 30.0-31.2)	
2-5 months old, n (%, 95% CI)	1592 (14.3, 13.7-14.9)	1371 (14.4, 13.7-15.1)	14,608 (28.5, 28.1-28.8)	3762 (29.1, 28.3-29.9)	15,259 (27.2, 26.8-27.6)	6379 (27.5, 26.9-28.1)	
6-11 months old, n (%, 95% CI)	8448 (75.9, 75.1-76.7)	6832 (71.6, 70.6- 72.5)	19,636 (38.3, 37.8-38.7)	5057 (39.1, 38.2-39.9)	22,357 (39.8, 39.4-40.2)	9724 (41.9, 41.3-42.6)	
12-59 months old, n (%, 95% CI)							
Sex							
Male, n (%, 95% CI)	6102 (54.8, 53.9-55.8)	5466 (57.2, 56.2-58.2)	27,302 (53.2, 52.8-53.6)	6591 (50.9, 50.1-51.8)	30,783 (54.8, 54.4-55.2)	13,342 (57.5, 56.9-58.1)	
Female, n (%, 95% CI)	4944 (44.4, 43.5-45.4)	4049 (42.4, 41.4-43.4)	22,939 (44.7, 44.3-45.1)	6290 (48.6, 47.7-49.4)	24,263 (43.2, 42.8-43.6)	9689 (41.8, 41.1-42.4)	
Missing, n (%)	78 (0.7)	33 (0.4)	1,079 (2.1)	55 (0.4)	1079 (1.9)	160 (0.7)	
Weight (in kg)							
Mean (SD)	10.3 (3.1)	10.2 (3.4)	8.4 (2.7)	8.4 (3.53)	8.1 (2.8)	8.1 (3.1)	
Missing, n (%)	3604 (32.4)	1362 (14.3)	2171 (4.2)	840 (6.5)	1866 (3.3)	1356 (5.8)	
WAZ							
>-2, n (%, 95% CI)	6373 (57.3, 56.4-58.2)	6760 (70.8, 69.9-71.7)	39,279 (76.5, 76.2-76.9)	9680 (74.8, 74.1-75.6)	35,211 (62.7, 62.3-63.1)	14,073 (60.7, 60.0-61.3)	
-3 <waz (%,="" 95%="" ci)<="" n="" td="" ≤-2,=""><td>947 (8.5, 8.0-9.0)</td><td>1123 (11.8, 11.1-12.4)</td><td>7357 (14.3, 14.0-14.6)</td><td>1964 (15.2, 14.6-15.8)</td><td>6747 (12.0, 11.7-12.3)</td><td>2637 (11.4, 11.0-11.8)</td></waz>	947 (8.5, 8.0-9.0)	1123 (11.8, 11.1-12.4)	7357 (14.3, 14.0-14.6)	1964 (15.2, 14.6-15.8)	6747 (12.0, 11.7-12.3)	2637 (11.4, 11.0-11.8)	
<-3 WAZ	NA	NA	NA	NA	9738 (17.3, 17.0-17.7)	4076 (17.6, 17.1-18.1)	
Missing, n (%)	3804 (34.2)	1665 (17.4)	4684 (9.1)	1292 (10.0)	4429 (7.9)	2405 (10.4)	
Body temperature							
35.5-37.9 C, n (%, 95% CI)	4765 (42.8, 41.9-43.8)	5350 (56.0, 55.0-57.0)	22,936 (44.7, 44.3-45.1)	8147 (63.0, 62.1-63.8)	24,501 (43.6, 43.2-44.1)	14,588 (62.9, 62.3-63.5)	
≥38.0 C, n (%, 95% CI)	6042 (54.3, 53.4-55.2)	4036 (42.3, 41.3-43.3)	20,808 (40.5, 40.1-41.0)	4641 (35.9, 35.0-36.7)	21,389 (38.1, 37.7-38.5)	7777 (33.5, 32.9-34.1)	
<35.5 C, n (%, 95% CI)	20 (0.2, 0.1-0.3)	21 (0.2, 0.1-0.3)	364 (0.7, 00.8)	37 (0.3, 0.2-0.4)	662 (1.2, 1.1-1.3)	201 (0.9, 0.7-1.0)	
Missing, n (%)	297 (2.7)	141 (1.5)	7212 (14.0)	111 (0.8)	9573 (17.1)	625 (2.7)	
Respiratory rate (breaths/min)							
median (IQR)	48.0 (42.0, 58.0)	50.0 (44.0,58.0)	60.0 (53.0-66.0)	56.0 (48.0, 64.0)	60.0 (54.0, 68.0)	56.0 (48.0, 64.0)	
Respiratory rate category	623 (5.6, 5.2-6.0)	416 (4.4, 3.9-4.8)	7136 (13.9, 13.6-14.2)	1379 (10.7, 10.1-11.2)	10,315 (18.4, 18.1-18.7)	3302 (14.2, 13.8-14.7)	
≥70, n (%, 95% CI)	10,501 (94.4, 93.9-94.8)	9132 (95.6, 95.2-96.0)	38,749 (75.5, 75.1-75.9)	11,034 (85.3, 84.7-85.9)	38,351 (68.3, 67.9-68.7)	19,293 (83.2, 82.7-83.7)	
<70, n (%, 95% CI)	0 (0.0)	0 (0.0)	5435 (10.6)	523 (4.0)	7459 (13.3)	596 (2.6)	
Missing, n (%)							
SpO <sub>2</sub>							
Median value (%), (IQR)	NA	96.0 (93.0, 97.0)	NA	94.0 (90.0, 96.0)	NA	94.0 (90.0, 97.0)	
SpO <sub>2</sub> category		7572 (79.3, 78.5-80.1)		8015 (62.0, 61.1-62.8)		14,654 (63.2, 62.6-63.8)	
SpO <sub>2</sub> 93-100%, n (%, 95% CI)		1243 (13.0, 12.3-13.7)		2375 (18.4, 17.7-19.0)		3736 (16.1, 17.8-19.1)	
SpO <sub>2</sub> 90-92%, n (%, 95% CI)		733 (7.7, 7.1-8.3)		2546 (19.7, 19.0-20.4)		4801 (20.7, 20.2-21.2)	
$SpO_2 < 90\%$ , n (%, 95% CI)							
Outcome							
Death, n (%, 95% CI)	97 (0.9, 0.7-1.1)	61 (0.6, 0.5-0.8)	1496 (2.9, 2.8-3.1)	450 (3.5, 3.2-3.8)	4,747 (8.5, 8.2-8.7)	1070 (4.6, 4.3-4.9)	
Survived, n (%, 95% CI)	11,027 (99.1, 98.9-99.3)	9487 (99.4, 99.2-99.5)	49,824 (97.1, 96.9-97.2)	12,486 (96.5, 96.2-96.8)	51,378 (91.5, 91.3-91.8)	22,121 (95.4, 95.1-95.6)	

SpO2: peripheral capillary oxyhemoglobin saturation, IQR: interquartile range, CI: confidence interval, SD: standard deviation, WAZ: WHO weight-for-age z-score; WHO, World Health Organization.

<sup>a</sup> Danger signs are either according to WHO pocketbook [6]; i.e.; central cyanosis, apnea, gasping, grunting, nasal flaring, audible wheeze, head nodding) or according to IMCI [7]; i.e.; general danger sign (inability to drink, lethargy or unconscious, convulsions, vomit everything), stridor in a calm child or weight-for-age z-score <-3.

Parameters	Children in which SpO <sub>2</sub> read	ing was not available	Children with any SpO <sub>2</sub> reading	Children in which SpO <sub>2</sub> read	ling was available	
				SpO <sub>2</sub> reading category		
	Studies with 100% missing	Studies with 1-99% missing		SpO <sub>2</sub> <90%	SpO <sub>2</sub> 90-92%	SpO <sub>2</sub> 93-100%
	Vetuces Deaths/total (CFR, 95% CI)	values Deaths/total (CFR, 95% CI)	Deaths/total (CFR, 95% CI)	Deaths/total (CFR, 95% CI)	Deaths/total (CFR, 95% CI)	Deaths/total (CFR, 95% CI)
Any severity of pneumonia	6048/104855 (5.8%, 5.6-5.9%)	292/13714 (2.1%, 1.9-2.4%)	1581/45675 (3.5%, 3.3-3.6%)	851/8080 (10.5%, 9.9-11.2%)	186/7354 (2.5%, 2.2-2.9%)	544/30241 (1.8%, 1.6-1.9%)
Pneumonia Classification						
Fast breathing	57/1944	40/9180	61/9548	20/733	7/1243	34/7572
I	(2.9%, 2.2-3.8%)	(0.4%, 0.3-0.6%)	(0.6%, 0.5-0.8%)	(2.5%, 1.7-4.2%)	(0.6%, 0.2-1.1%)	(0.4%, 0.3-0.6%)
Lower chest indrawing	1446/49309	50/2011	450/12936	262/2546	61/2375	127/8015
	(2.9%, 2.8-3.1%)	(2.5%, 1.8-3.3%)	(3.5%, 3.2-3.8%)	(10.3%, 9.1-11.5%)	(2.6%, 2.0-3.3%)	(1.6%, 1.3-1.9%)
Danger signs <sup>a</sup>	4545/53602	202/2523	1070/23191	569/4801	118/3736	383/14654
	(8.5%, 8.2-8.7%)	(8.0%, 7.0-9.1%)	(4.6%, 4.3-4.9%)	(11.8%, 10.9-12.8%)	(3.2%, 2.6-3.8%)	(2.6%, 2.4-2.9%)

S. Hooli, C. King, E.D. McCollum et al.

International Journal of Infectious Diseases 129 (2023) 240-250

The value of pulse oximetry is clear; however, other factors may play an important role in reducing chest-indrawing pneumonia deaths. Unlike children with chest-indrawing pneumonia receiving outpatient care, the children in this study had access to supplemental oxygen and hospital-based care and received injectable antibiotics yet they still died. Similar to ours, other studies identified age 2-11 months, moderate malnutrition, severe tachypnoea, and female sex as mortality risk factors among children with pneumonia [26,49,70]. These risk factors are plausible. Sexbased health disparities, including delayed care seeking, have been demonstrated in Africa and Asia and may explain some of these findings [26,49,71–73]. The excess mortality burden in infancy may reflect incomplete vaccination or a higher risk of occult untreated serious bacterial infection other than pneumonia, such as bacteremia, urinary tract infection, malaria, and meningitis [74,75]. Exploratory studies are necessary to identify how these risk factors could inform medical decision making in the triage, followup, and hospital care of children with chest-indrawing pneumonia. Although known to contribute to pneumonia-related [76] and allcause mortality, there is no formal disease-specific guidance on the care of children who are moderately malnourished. Targeted interventions could reduce pneumonia-related mortality in this group. For instance, the association of enteral protein intake during hospitalization with reduced 60-day mortality is well documented in critically ill children who are mechanically ventilated, independent of baseline nutrition status [77]. It is plausible that protein supplementation could reduce pneumonia-related mortality, particularly in children who are moderately malnourished. An ongoing phase II randomized controlled trial in Kenya and Uganda addresses this issue in children with severe (danger sign) pneumonia [78]. Other potential studies could evaluate if close outpatient follow-up, earlier hospital referral, or more intensive in-hospital monitoring of select groups, such as young infants aged 2-5 months, may reduce hospitalized pneumonia deaths.

# Limitations

This study had some limitations. First, most of these data are derived from studies conducted before or during the widespread PCV and Hib vaccine implementation. Accordingly, we may be overestimating the prevalence of severe and hypoxemic pneumonia and its associated mortality because 73% of infants now receive Hib vaccine, and around 45% receive PCV [79]. However, suggesting otherwise, our findings have a similar CFR as that of the PERCH study (6.7%), which examined the etiology of severe pneumonia in the postpneumococcal vaccination era [61]. Second, because the studies included in our dataset occurred before the WHO recommendation that chest-indrawing cases be managed with oral amoxicillin, the majority of these cases received injectable antibiotics. Third, HIV co-morbidity data were not commonly documented in the dataset. Pneumonia-associated hypoxemia and mortality are higher among children who are HIV-positive or -exposed [80]. Therefore, our findings are not generalizable to this highrisk patient group. In addition, other co-infections, such as malaria, were not accounted for [74]. Although, this may also reflect realworld conditions in settings without reliable HIV and malaria testing resources. Fourth, there are inherent differences in pulse oximeter devices, training, and supervision, which could affect the accuracy of SpO<sub>2</sub> measurements and our findings. Fifth, only 6.1% of this dataset included information on signs of respiratory distress. Given that these are considered danger signs that warrant hospitalization, we cannot be certain that some of the cases with chest indrawing did not also have signs of respiratory distress. Sixth, we collated data from a diverse range of settings and a large proportion of unmeasured pulse oximetry cases came from a single 10-year study in Malawi. To address this, we conducted a sen-

#### Table 4

Clinical characteristics associated with death of children aged 2-59 months hospitalized with chest-indrawing pneumonia with pulse oximetry assessment (n = 12,936).

Variable	Bivariate				Adjusted OR <sup>a</sup> (95% CI)
	Died, $(n = 450)$	Survived, $(n = 12486)$	OR (95% CI)	P-value	
	n (%)	n (%)			
Study design					
Clinical trial	43 (1.6)	2,674 (98.4)	0.39 (0.28-0.53)	< 0.0001	0.25 (0.16-0.37)
Observational study	407 (4.0)	9,812 (96.0)	1.00 (reference)		1.00 (reference)
Pneumococcal vaccine rollout					
Yes	34 (1.4)	2,490 (98.6)	0.33 (0.23-0.47)		0.36 (0.22-0.60)1.00
No	416 (4.0)	9,996 (96.0)	1.00 (reference)		(reference)
Age categories					
2-5 months	303 (7.4)	3,814 (92.6)	7.95 (5.88-10.76)	< 0.0001	9.94 (6.67-14.84)
6-11 months	97 (2.6)	3,665 (97.4)	2.65 (1.88-3.74)	< 0.0001	2.67 (1.71-4.16)
12-59 months	50 (1.0)	5,007 (99.0)	1.00 (reference)		1.00 (reference)
Sex					
Male	170 (2.6)	6,421 (97.4)	1.00 (reference)	< 0.0001	1.00 (reference)
Female	278 (4.4)	6,012 (95.6)	1.75 (1.44-2.12)		1.82 (1.43-2.32)
Missing	2 (3.6)	53 (96.4)			
WAZ categories					
WAZ > -2	249 (2.6)	9,431 (97.4)	1.00 (reference)	< 0.0001	1.00 (reference)
-3 <waz <-2<="" td=""><td>114 (5.8)</td><td>1,850 (94.2)</td><td>2.33 (1.86-2.93)</td><td></td><td>2.41 (1.87-3.09)</td></waz>	114 (5.8)	1,850 (94.2)	2.33 (1.86-2.93)		2.41 (1.87-3.09)
Missing	87 (6.7)	1,205 (93.3)			
Body temperature					
Normal temperature (35.5-37.9 C)	291 (3.6)	7,856 (96.4)	1.00 (reference)	0.311	1.00 (reference)
Fever (≥38.0 C)	150 (3.2)	4,491 (96.8)	0.90 (0.74-1.10)	0.552	0.81 (0.64-1.03)
Hypothermia (<35.5 C)	2 (5.4)	35 (94.6)	1.54 (0.37-6.44)		2.17 (0.28-17.02)
Missing	7 (6.3)	104 (93.7)			
Respiratory rate (breaths/min)					
Respiratory rate <70 breaths/min	355 (3.2)	10,679 (96.8)	1.00 (reference)	< 0.0001	1.00 (reference)
Respiratory rate $\geq$ 70 breaths/min	83 (6.0)	1,296 (94.0)	1.93 (1.50-2.46)		1.31 (0.98-1.76)
Missing	12 (2.3)	511 (97.7)			
SpO <sub>2</sub> categories					
SpO <sub>2</sub> 93-100%	127 (1.6)	7,888 (98.4)	1.00 (reference)	0.002	1.00 (reference)
SpO <sub>2</sub> 90-92%	61 (2.6)	2,314 (97.4)	1.64 (1.20-2.23)	< 0.0001	1.36 (0.96-1.92)
SpO <sub>2</sub> <90%	262 (10.3)	2,284 (89.7)	7.12 (5.74-8.85)		4.14 (3.19-5.36)

OR: odds ratio; WAZ: weight-for-age z-score; SpO2: oxygen saturation.

<sup>a</sup> Adjusted for study design, PCV rollout, age, sex, weight-or-age z-score, body temperature, respiratory rate and oxygen saturation.

sitivity analysis and found that moderate malnutrition remained a mortality risk factor even when the Malawian cases were excluded. Seventh, we were unable to assess for study-level variance in the duration of illness before hospitalization, length of hospitalization, and time to inpatient death, which may reflect the differences in care-seeking behaviors and clinician judgment to hospitalize a patient. There are certainly other unmeasured factors affecting child pneumonia in-hospital mortality, which we are unable to account for. Finally, we aggregated data from a wide variety of studies conducted in many different countries, which may limit the applicability of our findings to local contexts. Some of the data are from clinical trials or prospective studies with dedicated study staff, whereas others are from routine care settings; as such, there is variability in the quality of the reported data. We are unable to account for how management differences affected the patient outcomes. From an implementation perspective, the use of data collected outside of a funded, well-staffed, and well-supplied clinical trial may be a strength because these data more accurately reflect the real-world conditions of healthcare delivery in LMICs.

## Conclusion

Pulse oximetry use is critical to providing effective pneumonia care. Given that many LMIC ALRI care settings do not have or use pulse oximeters and that danger signs and chest-indrawing cases had a high prevalence of hypoxemia and associated CFR, we can conclude that many children who could benefit from supplemental oxygen are going unrecognized. This represents a missed opportunity to reduce child pneumonia deaths. A substantial proportion of chest-indrawing pneumonia deaths were not hypoxemic. Exploratory research is needed to understand how mortality risk factors, such as moderate malnutrition and young age, could be used to guide care to reduce mortality. Our findings suggest that pulse oximetry should be integrated in the clinical evaluation of children aged 5 years who are hospitalized with ALRI, particularly for children with chest-indrawing pneumonia.

## **Declaration of competing interest**

The authors have no competing interests to declare. YBN is a staff member of the WHO. The expressed views and opinions do not necessarily represent the policies of the WHO.

# Funding

The Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, Seattle, WA, USA (#INV-007927).

# **Ethical approval**

All studies included in this deidentified data set were previously granted clearance by ethical review boards at each participating site.

# Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank the children and their families who participated in the included studies.

# **Author contributions**

SAQ secured the funding. SH, CKin, YBN, and SAQ conceptualized and designed the study, interpreted the data, and wrote the first draft of the manuscript. YBN verified the data and conducted statistical analyses. CKin, EDM, TC, NL, CM, CG, ST, CC, SM, MN, BG, TH, JM, EA, NC, MH, PH, PJ, JL, WM, AP, DT, NN, SZ, RR, ML, CK, CT, RA, SB, II, IM, GM, SKS, MS, SS, SAwa, AB, MC, PN, JP, VR, GR, MSyl, PV, JW, SBha, TS, MN, LA, ME, SBas, NW, RL, SA, AG, MC, SHir, KO, AC, CR, HC, HN, JF, LW, and MH oversaw the data collection, verified the data, assisted with interpretation of the data, and reviewed and edited the final manuscript. SH and YBN had final responsibility for the decision to submit for publication.

#### **Data sharing**

Data used for this study will be available upon request. Deidentified participant data and a data dictionary will be made available after all planned analyses are completed. Data will be shared after approval of request. All data requests should be directed to the corresponding author, Dr. Yasir Bin Nisar.

#### Supplementary materials

Supplementary material associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at doi:10.1016/j.ijid.2023.02.005.

#### References

- [1] GBD 2015 LRI CollaboratorsEstimates of the global, regional, and national morbidity, mortality, and aetiologies of lower respiratory tract infections in 195 countries: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2015. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2017;**17**:1133–61. doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(17)30396-1.
- [2] Addo-Yobo E, Chisaka N, Hassan M, Hibberd P, Lozano JM, Jeena P, et al. Oral amoxicillin versus injectable penicillin for severe pneumonia in children aged 3 to 59 months: a randomised multicentre equivalency study. *Lancet* 2004;**364**:1141–8. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(04)17100-6.
- [3] Hazir T, Fox LM, Nisar YB, Fox MP, Ashraf YP, MacLeod WB, et al. Ambulatory short-course high-dose oral amoxicillin for treatment of severe pneumonia in children: a randomised equivalency trial. *Lancet* 2008;**371**:49–56. doi:10.1016/ S0140-6736(08)60071-9.
- [4] Das RR, Singh M. Treatment of severe community-acquired pneumonia with oral amoxicillin in under-five children in developing country: a systematic review. PLoS One 2013;8:e66232. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0066232.
- [5] World Health Organization Recommendations for management of common childhood conditions: evidence for technical update of pocket book recommendations: newborn conditions, dysentery, pneumonia, oxygen use and delivery, common causes of fever, severe acute malnutrition and supportive care. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2012.
- [6] World Health Organization. Pocket book of hospital care for children: guidelines for the management of common childhood illnesses. 2nd ed., 2013 ed. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2013.
- [7] World Health Organization Integrated Management of Childhood Illness (IMCI): chart booklet. 2nd ed. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2014.
- [8] World Health Organization Pocket book of hospital care for children: guidelines for the management of common illnesses with limited resources. 1st ed. Geneva: World Health Organization; 2005.
- [9] Patel AB, Bang A, Singh M, Dhande L, Chelliah LR, Malik A, et al. A randomized controlled trial of hospital versus home based therapy with oral amoxicillin for severe pneumonia in children aged 3–59 months: the IndiaCLEN Severe Pneumonia Oral Therapy (ISPOT) Study. *BMC Pediatr* 2015;**15**:186. doi:10.1186/ s12887-015-0510-9.
- [10] Ginsburg AS, Mvalo T, Nkwopara E, McCollum ED, Phiri M, Schmicker R, et al. Amoxicillin for 3 or 5 days for chest-indrawing pneumonia in Malawian children. N Engl J Med 2020;383:13–23. doi:10.1056/NEJMoa1912400.
- [11] Agweyu A, Gathara D, Oliwa J, Muinga N, Edwards T, Allen E, et al. Oral amoxicillin versus benzyl penicillin for severe pneumonia among Kenyan children: a pragmatic randomized controlled noninferiority trial. *Clin Infect Dis* 2015;**60**:1216–24. doi:10.1093/cid/ciu1166.
- [12] Bari A, Sadruddin S, Khan A, et al. Community case management of severe pneumonia with oral amoxicillin in children aged 2–59 months in Haripur district, Pakistan: a cluster randomised trial. *Lancet* 2011;**378**:1796–803. doi:10. 1016/S0140-6736(11)61140-9.
- [13] Soofi S, Ahmed S, Fox MP, MacLeod WB, Thea DM, Qazi SA, et al. Effectiveness of community case management of severe pneumonia with oral amoxicillin in children aged 2–59 months in Matiari district, rural Pakistan: a cluster-randomised controlled trial. *Lancet* 2012;**379**:729–37. doi:10.1016/ S0140-6736(11)61714-5.

- [14] Morre R, Sobi K, Pameh W, Ripa P, Vince JD, Duke T. Safety, effectiveness and feasibility of outpatient management of children with pneumonia with chest indrawing at Port Moresby general hospital, Papua New Guinea. J Trop Pediatr 2019;65:71–7. doi:10.1093/tropej/fmy013.
- [15] Onono M, Abdi M, Mutai K, Asadhi E, Nyamai R, Okoth P, et al. Community case management of lower chest indrawing pneumonia with oral amoxicillin in children in Kenya. Acta Paediatr 2018;107:44–52. doi:10.1111/apa.14405.
- [16] West JB. Respiratory physiology: the essentials. Baltimore: Williams & Wilkins; 1973.
- [17] McCollum ED, King C, Ahmed S, Hanif AAM, Roy AD, Islam AA, et al. Defining hypoxaemia from pulse oximeter measurements of oxygen saturation in well children at low altitude in Bangladesh: an observational study. *BMJ Open Respir Res* 2021;8:e001023. doi:10.1136/bmjresp-2021-001023.
- [18] Ginsburg AS, Van Cleve WC, Thompson MIW, English M. Oxygen and pulse oximetry in childhood pneumonia: a survey of healthcare providers in resource-limited settings. J Trop Pediatr 2012;58:389–93. doi:10.1093/tropej/ fmr103.
- [19] Enoch AJ, English M, Network Clinical Information, McGivern G, Shepperd S. Variability in the use of pulse oximeters with children in Kenyan hospitals: A mixed-methods analysis. *PLoS Med* 2019;**16**:e1002987. doi:10.1371/journal. pmed.1002987.
- [20] World Health Organization. Oxygen therapy for children: a manual for health workers. *Geneva: World Health Organization* 2016.
- [21] Alwadhi V, Dewan P, Malhotra RK, Shah D, Gupta P. Tachypnea and other danger signs vs pulse oximetry for prediction of hypoxia in severe pneumonia/very severe disease. *Indian Pediatr* 2017;54:729–34. doi:10.1007/ s13312-017-1163-6.
- [22] Bassat Q, Lanaspa M, Machevo S, O'Callaghan-Gordo C, Madrid L, Nhampossa T, et al. Hypoxaemia in Mozambican children <5 years of age admitted to hospital with clinical severe pneumonia: clinical features and performance of predictor models. *Trop Med Int Health* 2016;21:1147–56. doi:10.1111/tmi.12738.
- [23] Chisti MJ, Salam MA, Ashraf H, Faruque ASG, Bardhan PK, Shahid AS, et al. Predictors and outcome of hypoxemia in severely malnourished children under five with pneumonia: a case control design. *PLoS One* 2013;8:e51376. doi:10. 1371/journal.pone.0051376.
- [24] Usen S, Weber M, Mulholland K, Jaffar S, Oparaugo A, Omosigho C, et al. Clinical predictors of hypoxaemia in Gambian children with acute lower respiratory tract infection: prospective cohort study. *BMJ* 1999;**318**:86–91. doi:10. 1136/bmj.318.7176.86.
- [25] Kuti BP, Adegoke SA, Ebruke BE, Howie S, Oyelami OA, Ota M. Determinants of oxygen therapy in childhood pneumonia in a resource-constrained region. *ISRN Pediatr* 2013;2013:435976. doi:10.1155/2013/435976.
- [26] Agweyu A, Lilford RJ, English M, Irimu G, Ayieko P, Akech S, Githanga D, Were F, Kigen B, Ng'arng'ar S, Aduro N, Inginia R, Mutai B, Ochieng G, Thuranira L, Kanyingi F, Kuria M, Otido S, Rutha K, Njiiri P, Chabi M, Nzioki C, Ondere J, Emadau C, Mutiso C, Mutai L, Manyasi C, Kimutai D, Muturi C, Mithamo A, Kamunya A, Kariuki A, Wachira G, Musabi M, Charo S, Muinga N, Chepkirui M, Tuti T, Makone B, Nyachiro W, Mbevi G, Julius T, Gachau S, Ogero M, Bitok M, Wafula J. Appropriateness of clinical severity classification of new WHO childhood pneumonia guidance: a multi-hospital, retrospective, cohort study. *Lancet Glob Health* 2018;6:e74–83. doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(17) 30448-5.
- [27] Ugpo J, Lucero M, Williams G, Lechago M, Nillos L, Tallo V, et al. Reactogenicity and tolerability of a non-adjuvanted 11-valent diphtheria-tetanus toxoid Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine in Filipino children. *Vaccine* 2009;27:2723– 9. doi:10.1016/j.vaccine.2008.10.026.
- [28] Basnet S, Shrestha PS, Sharma A, Mathisen M, Prasai R, Bhandari N, et al. A randomized controlled trial of zinc as adjuvant therapy for severe pneumonia in young children. *Pediatrics* 2012;**129**:701–8. doi:10.1542/peds.2010-3091.
- [29] Mathew JL, Singhi S, Ray P, Hagel E, Saghafian-Hedengren S, Bansal A, et al. Etiology of community acquired pneumonia among children in India: prospective, cohort study. J Glob Health 2015;5:050418. doi:10.7189/jogh.05.020418.
- [30] Clara WC. Unpublished data from David. Chiriqui Province, Panama.
- [31] Marcone DN, Ellis A, Videla C, Ekstrom J, Ricarte C, Carballal G, et al. Viral etiology of acute respiratory infections in hospitalized and outpatient children in Buenos Aires, Argentina. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* 2013;**32**:e105–10. doi:10.1097/ INF.0b013e31827cd06f.
- [32] Bénet T, Sánchez Picot V, Messaoudi M, Chou M, Eap T, Wang J, et al. Microorganisms associated with pneumonia in children <5 years of age in developing and emerging countries: the GABRIEL pneumonia multicenter, prospective, case-control study. *Clin Infect Dis* 2017;65:604–12. doi:10.1093/cid/cix378.
- [33] McCollum ED, Nambiar B, Deula R, Zadutsa B, Bondo A, King C, et al. Impact of the 13-valent Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine on clinical and hypoxemic childhood pneumonia over three years in central Malawi: an observational study. *PLoS One* 2017;**12**:e0168209. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0168209.
- [34] Lazzerini M, Seward N, Lufesi N, Banda R, Sinyeka S, Masache G, et al. Mortality and its risk factors in Malawian children admitted to hospital with clinical pneumonia, 2001–12: a retrospective observational study. *Lancet Glob Health* 2016;4:e57–68. doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(15)00215-6.
- [35] Gentile Á, Juarez Mdel V, Luciön MF, Romanin VS, Giglio N, Bakin J. Influence of respiratory viruses on the evaluation of the 13-valent Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine effectiveness in children under 5 years old: a timeseries study for the 2001-2013 period. Arch Argent Pediatr 2015;113:310–16. doi:10.5546/aap.2015.eng.310.
- [36] Gessner BD, Sutanto A, Linehan M, Djelantik IGG, Fletcher T, Gerudug IK, et al. Incidences of vaccine-preventable Haemophilus influenzae type b pneumonia

and meningitis in Indonesian children: hamlet-randomised vaccine-probe trial. *Lancet* 2005;**365**:43–52. doi:10.1016/s0140-6736(04)17664-2.

- [37] Lu Y, Baggett HC, Rhodes J, Thamthitiwat S, Joseph L, Gregory CJ. Bayesian latent class estimation of the incidence of chest radiograph-confirmed pneumonia in rural Thailand. *Epidemiol Infect* 2016;144:2858–65. doi:10.1017/ S0950268816000455.
- [38] Hirve S, Chadha M, Lele P, Lafond KE, Deoshatwar A, Sambhudas S, et al. Performance of case definitions used for influenza surveillance among hospitalized patients in a rural area of India. *Bull World Health Organ* 2012;90:804–12. doi:10.2471/BLT.12.108837.
- [39] Hortal M, Estevan M, Iraola I, De Mucio B. A population-based assessment of the disease burden of consolidated pneumonia in hospitalized children under five years of age. Int J Infect Dis 2007;11:273–7. doi:10.1016/j.ijid.2006.05.006.
- [40] Wulandari DA, Sudarwati S, Tirtosudiro MA, Nataprawira HM, Kartasasmita CD. Risk factors for mortality in children hospitalized with pneumonia in hasan Sadikin hospital. Beijing: Asian Paediatric Pulmonology Society; 2018.
- [41] Klugman KP, Madhi SA, Huebner RE, Kohberger R, Mbelle N, Pierce N, et al. A trial of a 9-valent Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine in children with and those without HIV infection. N Engl J Med 2003;349:1341–8. doi:10.1056/ NEJMoa035060.
- [42] Neuman MI, Monuteaux MC, Scully KJ, Bachur RG. Prediction of pneumonia in a pediatric emergency department. *Pediatrics* 2011;**128**:246–53. doi:10.1542/ peds.2010-3367.
- [43] O'Grady KA, Torzillo PJ, Ruben AR, Taylor-Thomson D, Valery PC, Chang AB. Identification of radiological alveolar pneumonia in children with high rates of hospitalized respiratory infections: comparison of WHO-defined and pediatric pulmonologist diagnosis in the clinical context. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 2012;**47**:386– 92. doi:10.1002/ppul.21551.
- [44] Ferrero F, Nascimento-Carvalho CM, Cardoso MR, Camargos P, March MF, Berezin E, et al. Radiographic findings among children hospitalized with severe community-acquired pneumonia. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 2010;45:1009–13. doi:10. 1002/ppul.21287.
- [45] Asghar R, Banajeh S, Egas J, Hibberd P, Iqbal I, Katep-Bwalya M, et al. Chloramphenicol versus ampicillin plus gentamicin for community acquired very severe pneumonia among children aged 2–59 months in low resource settings: multicentre randomised controlled trial (SPEAR study). *BMJ* 2008;**336**:80–4. doi:10.1136/bmj.39421.435949.BE.
- [46] Turner C, Turner P, Carrara V, Burgoine K, Tha Ler Htoo S, Watthanaworawit W, et al. High rates of pneumonia in children under two years of age in a South East Asian refugee population. *PLoS One* 2013;8:e54026. doi:10.1371/journal. pone.0054026.
- [47] Wadhwa N, Chandran A, Aneja S, Lodha R, Kabra SK, Chaturvedi MK, et al. Efficacy of zinc given as an adjunct in the treatment of severe and very severe pneumonia in hospitalized children 2–24 mo of age: a randomized, doubleblind, placebo-controlled trial. Am J Clin Nutr 2013;97:1387–94. doi:10.3945/ ajcn.112.052951.
- [48] Cutts FT, Zaman SMA, Enwere G, Jaffar S, Levine OS, Okoko JB, et al. Efficacy of nine-valent Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine against pneumonia and invasive pneumococcal disease in the Gambia: randomised, double-blind, placebo-controlled trial. *Lancet* 2005;**365**:1139–46. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(05) 71876-6.
- [49] Hooli S, Colbourn T, Lufesi N, Costello A, Nambiar B, Thammasitboon S, et al. Predicting hospitalised paediatric pneumonia mortality risk: an external validation of RISC and mRISC, and local tool development (RISC-Malawi) from Malawi. PLoS One 2016;11:e0168126. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0168126.
- [50] Lazzerini M, Sonego M, Pellegrin MC. Hypoxaemia as a mortality risk factor in acute lower respiratory infections in children in low and middle-income countries: systematic review and meta-analysis. *PloS One* 2015;**10**:e0136166. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0136166.
- [51] Duke T, Pulsan F, Panauwe D, Hwaihwanje I, et al. Solar-powered oxygen, quality improvement and child pneumonia deaths: a large-scale effectiveness study. Arch Dis Child 2021;106:224–30. doi:10.1136/archdischild-2020-320107.
- [52] Enoch AJ, English M, Shepperd S. Does pulse oximeter use impact health outcomes? A systematic review. Arch Dis Child 2016;101:694–700. doi:10.1136/ archdischild-2015-309638.
- [53] Tesfaye SH, Gebeyehu Y, Loha E, Johansson KA, Lindtjørn B. Pulse oximeter with integrated management of childhood illness for diagnosis of severe childhood pneumonia at rural health institutions in Southern Ethiopia: results from a cluster-randomised controlled trial. *BMJ Open* 2020;10:e036814. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2020-036814.
- [54] Anderson AB, Zwerdling RG, Dewitt TG. The clinical utility of pulse oximetry in the pediatric emergency department setting. *Pediatr Emerg Care* 1991;7:263–6. doi:10.1097/00006565-199110000-00001.
- [55] Chew R, Zhang M, Chandna A, Lubell Y. The impact of pulse oximetry on diagnosis, management and outcomes of acute febrile illness in lowincome and middle-income countries: a systematic review. *BMJ Glob Health* 2021;6:e007282. doi:10.1136/bmjgh-2021-007282.
- [56] Graham HR, Maher J, Bakare AA, Nguyen CD, Ayede AI, Oyewole OB, et al. Oxygen systems and quality of care for children with pneumonia, malaria and diarrhoea: analysis of a stepped-wedge trial in Nigeria. *PLoS One* 2021;**16**:e0254229. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0254229.
- [57] Graham HR, Bakare AA, Ayede AI, Gray AZ, McPake B, Peel D, et al. Oxygen systems to improve clinical care and outcomes for children and neonates: a stepped-wedge cluster-randomised trial in Nigeria. *PLoS Med* 2019;**16**:e1002951. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.1002951.
- [58] Subhi R, Adamson M, Campbell H, Weber M, Smith K, Duke T, et al. The preva-

lence of hypoxaemia among ill children in developing countries: a systematic review. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2009;**9**:219–27. doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(09)70071-4.

[59] Lozano JM. Epidemiology of hypoxaemia in children with acute lower respiratory infection. Int J Tuberc Lung Dis 2001;5:496–504.

- [60] Rahman AE, Hossain AT, Nair H, Chisti MJ, Dockrell D, Arifeen SE, et al. Prevalence of hypoxaemia in children with pneumonia in low-income and middleincome countries: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Lancet Glob Health* 2022;10:e348–59. doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(21)00586-6.
- [61] Pneumonia Etiology Research for Child Health (PERCH) Study GroupCauses of severe pneumonia requiring hospital admission in children without HIV infection from Africa and Asia: the PERCH multi-country case-control study. *Lancet* 2019;**394**:757–79. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(19)30721-4.
- [62] Gallagher KE, Knoll MD, Prosperi C, Baggett HC, Brooks WA, Feikin DR, et al. The predictive performance of a pneumonia severity score in human immunodeficiency virus-negative children presenting to hospital in 7 lowand middle-income countries. *Clin Infect Dis* 2020;**70**:1050–7. doi:10.1093/cid/ ciz350.
- [63] Safiri S, Kolahi AA, Noori M, Nejadghaderi SA, Karamzad N, Bragazzi NL, et al. Burden of anemia and its underlying causes in 204 countries and territories, 1990–2019: results from the Global Burden of Disease Study 2019. J Hematol Oncol 2021;14:185. doi:10.1186/s13045-021-01202-2.
- [64] McCollum ED, Bjornstad E, Preidis GA, Hosseinipour MC, Lufesi N. Multicenter study of hypoxemia prevalence and quality of oxygen treatment for hospitalized Malawian children. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg* 2013;107:285–92. doi:10.1093/trstmh/trt017.
- [65] Starr N, Rebollo D, Asemu YM, Akalu L, Mohammed HA, Menchamo MW, et al. Pulse oximetry in low-resource settings during the COVID-19 pandemic. *Lancet Glob Health* 2020;8:e1121-2. doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(20)30287-4.
- [66] Tolla HS, Letebo M, Asemere YA, Belete AB, Tumbule TC, Fekadu ZF, et al. Use of pulse oximetry during initial assessments of children under five with pneumonia: a retrospective cross-sectional study from 14 hospitals in Ethiopia. J Glob Health Rep 2019;3. doi:10.29392/joghr.3.e2019016.
- [67] Fashanu C, Mekonnen T, Amedu J, Onwundiwe N, Adebiyi A, Omokere O, et al. Improved oxygen systems at hospitals in three Nigerian states: an implementation research study. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 2020;55:S65–77. doi:10.1002/ppul. 24694.
- [68] McCollum ED, King C, Deula R, Zadutsa B, Mankhambo L, Nambiar B, et al. Pulse oximetry for children with pneumonia treated as outpatients in rural Malawi. Bull World Health Organ 2016;94:893–902. doi:10.2471/BLT.16.173401.
- [69] Graham HR, Bakare AA, Gray A, Ayede AI, Qazi S, McPake B, et al. Adoption of paediatric and neonatal pulse oximetry by 12 hospitals in Nigeria: a mixed-methods realist evaluation. *BMJ Glob Health* 2018;**3**:e000812. doi:10. 1136/bmjgh-2018-000812.
- [70] Madrid L, Casellas A, Sacoor C, Quintó L, Sitoe A, Varo R, et al. Postdischarge mortality prediction in sub-Saharan Africa. *Pediatrics* 2019;143. doi:10.1542/ peds.2018-0606.
- [71] Hooli S, King C, Zadutsa B, Nambiar B, Makwenda C, Masache G, et al. The epidemiology of hypoxemic pneumonia among young infants in Malawi. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 2020;**102**:676–83. doi:10.4269/ajtmh.19-0516.
- [72] Sonego M, Pellegrin MC, Becker G, Lazzerini M. Risk factors for mortality from acute lower respiratory infections (ALRI) in children under five years of age in low and middle-income countries: a systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies. *PLoS One* 2015;**10**:e0116380. doi:10.1371/journal.pone. 0116380.
- [73] Kennedy E, Binder G, Humphries-Waa K, Tidhar T, Cini K, Comrie-Thomson L, et al. Gender inequalities in health and wellbeing across the first two decades of life: an analysis of 40 low-income and middle-income countries in the Asia-Pacific region. *Lancet Glob Health* 2020;8:e1473–88. doi:10.1016/ S2214-109X(20)30354-5.
- [74] D'Acremont V, Kilowoko M, Kyungu E, Philipina S, Sangu W, Kahama-Maro J, et al. Beyond malaria-causes of fever in outpatient Tanzanian children. N Engl J Med 2014;370:809–17. doi:10.1056/NEJMoa1214482.
- [75] Hsiao AL, Chen L, Baker MD. Incidence and predictors of serious bacterial infections among 57- to 180-day-old infants. *Pediatrics* 2006;**117**:1695–701. doi:10.1542/peds.2005-1673.
- [76] Kirolos A, Blacow RM, Parajuli A, Welton NJ, Khanna A, Allen SJ, et al. The impact of childhood malnutrition on mortality from pneumonia: a systematic review and network meta-analysis. *BMJ Glob Health* 2021;6:e007411. doi:10.1136/ bmjgh-2021-007411.
- [77] Mehta NM, Bechard LJ, Zurakowski D, Duggan CP, Heyland DK. Adequate enteral protein intake is inversely associated with 60-d mortality in critically ill children: a multicenter, prospective, cohort study1. Am J Clin Nutr 2015;102:199–206. doi:10.3945/ajcn.114.104893.
- [78] Kiguli S, Olopot-Olupot P, Alaroker F, Engoru C, Opoka RO, Tagoola A, et al. Children's Oxygen Administration Strategies and Nutrition Trial (COAST-Nutrition): a protocol for a phase II randomised controlled trial. *Wellcome Open Res* 2021;6:221. doi:10.12688/wellcomeopenres.17123.2.
- [79] Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, International Vaccine Access Center (IVAC). VIEW-hub Report: Global Vaccine Introduction and Implementation, https://www.jhsph.edu/ivac/wp-content/uploads/ 2021/05/VIEW-hubReport\_March2021.pdf; 2021 [accessed 21 June 2021].
- [80] Theodoratou E, McAllister DA, Reed C, Adeloye DO, Rudan I, Muhe LM, et al. Global, regional, and national estimates of pneumonia burden in HIV-infected children in 2010: a meta-analysis and modelling study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2014;14:1250–8. doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(14)70990-9.